REPORT RESUMES

ED 015 315 VT 004 093

FOLLOW-UP STUDY OF MDTA E AND D PROJECT CONDUCTED BY THE MICHIGAN CATHOLIC CONFERENCE, LANSING.

BY- BUENAVENTURA, ANGELES

BUREAU OF SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH, INC., WASH., D.C.

REPORT NUMBER BSSR-369 PUB DATE MAR 67

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.50 HC-$4.56 112P.

DESCRIPTORS- PROGRAM DESCRIPTIONS, PROGRAM EVALUATION, PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT, *DISADVANTAGED GROUPS, VOCATIONAL TRAINING CENTERS, VOCATIONAL EDUCATION, ON THE JOB TRAINING, UNEMPLOYED, ADULT BASIC EDUCATION, SPANISH AMERICANS, NEGROES, CAUCASIANS, SOCIAL SERVICES, JOB PLACEMENT, *DEMONSTRATION PROGRAMS, *VOCATIONAL REHABILITATION, *EMPLOYMENT PROGRAMS, VOCATIONAL COUNSELING, RECRUITMENT, VOCATIONAL FOLLOWUP, INDIVIDUAL CHARACTERISTICS, MANPOWER DEVELOPMENT, MDTA PROGRAMS, LANSING, MICHIGAN,

REPRESENTATIVES OF SPANISH-SPEAKING FORMER MIGRANTS (FARM WORKERS) AND OTHER DISADVANTAGED GROUPS, NEGRO AND WHITE, PARTICIPATED IN A PROGRAM, TO DEMONSTRATE THAT UNSKILLED PERSONS WITH LITTLE FORMAL EDUCATION AND LIMITED COMMAND OF THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE COULD BE SUCCESSFULLY TRAINED AND PLACED IN OCCUPATIONS FOR WHICH THERE WAS LOCAL DEMAND AND MOTIVATE INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES IN THE PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT AND WELFARE AGENCIES IN LANSING FOR IMPROVING AND EXPANDING SERVICES TO THE HARD-CORE UNEMPLOYED. POST-TRAINING INTERVIEWS WITH THE 155 TRAINEES, 99 APPLICANTS, THE PROJECT STAFF, AND VARIOUS KNOWLEDGEABLE COMMUNITY MEMBERS CLEARLY DEMONSTRATED THAT THE TARGET POPULATION COULD BE EFFECTIVELY TRAINED AND PLACED THROUGH A COMPREHENSIVE TREATMENT APPROACH WHICH INCLUDES BASIC EDUCATION, VOCATIONAL TRAINING, CULTURAL ORIENTATION, AND INTENSIVE COUNSELING. ALTHOUGH THE SUCCESSFUL PLACEMENT RATE OF 85 PERCENT AT 3 MONTHS AND 67 PERCENT AT 2 MONTHS AFTER TRAINING WAS AIDED BY FAVORABLE LABOR MARKET CONDITIONS IN LANSING, THIS SAME DISADVANTAGED GROUP WAS UNABLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF EQUALLY FAVORABLE JOB OPPORTUNITIES BEFORE TRAINING. THE SECOND GOAL WAS NOT ACHIEVED PARTIALLY BECAUSE THE VARIOUS AGENCIES WERE MORE INTERESTED IN HAVING THE TRAINING CENTER CONTINUE TO CARRY THE BURDEN OF AIDING THE HARD-CORE UNEMPLOYED THAN THEY WERE IN ADOPTING THE SUCCESSFUL TECHNIQUES IT DEMONSTRATED. (ET)

"Special Manpower Volume"

BSSR

ED015315

BUREAU OF SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH, INC.

WASHINGTON, D. C.

VT004093

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

FOLLOW-UP STUDY OF MDTA E & D PROJECT CONDUCTED BY THE MICHIGAN CATHOLIC CONFERENCE, LANSING

Submitted to:

Office of Manpower Policy, Evaluation, and Research
U. S. Department of Labor
(Contract 83-08-03)

Angeles Buenaventura

BUREAU OF SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH, INC.
1200 Seventeenth Street, N. W.
Washington, D. C. 20036

March 1967

BSSR:369

FOREWORD

This report is one of a series of reports on each of eight experimental and demonstration training projects followed up by the Bureau of Social Science Research under Contract Number 83-08-03 with the Office of Manpower, Automation and Training (now the Office of Manpower Policy, Evaluation and Research) of the U. S. Department of Labor. The eight training projects were conducted by seven institutions scattered from Michigan to Florida. Six of the institutions were considered to be "predominately Negro" colleges: Bluefield State College (West Virginia), Florida A & M University, Morgan State College (Maryland), A & T College of North Carolina, Tennessee A & I State University, and Tuskegee Institute (Alabama). The seventh institution was the Job Training Center in Lansing sponsored by the Michigan Catholic Conference. An over-all report will pool the experiences of the several projects and consider their implications for future manpower development programs.

The follow-up studies had three general objectives:

1. to document that the target populations--individuals with especially difficult employment problems--were serviced, that they are trainable and that these institutions can train them;
2. to document whether the training may have affected the employment situation of the trainees: that "trainability" leads to "employability"; and,
3. to identify components of the training projects and community characteristics which may have contributed to the training and employment outcomes.

The "ideal" research design called for "before-after" studies. The timing of the award of the follow-up contract by OMAT to BSSR precluded the execution in its pure form of this design. The contract was awarded after one project had terminated, four others had begun, and the remaining three were about to begin. In all reports the "before" data are based on retrospective observations.

The study plan called for the integration of three distinct bodies of data into detailed reports on the individual projects. The starting point for the analysis was a series of discussions with members of the project staff at each of the training centers. These discussions yielded detailed information about the actual conduct of each project, its goals and methods. From these meetings and discussions it was possible to assemble pertinent histories for each project. Because of the method employed, the central perspective of each history was that of the persons charged with the conduct of the individual projects; the administrators, the instructors and counselors, and officials of the public agencies who may have cooperated in the conduct of the projects. In addition, records which helped to clarify the goals and conduct of the projects were made available to BSSR by OMAT.

This administrative perspective was broadened by a second body of data concerning special conditions in each of the areas where training was given. Discussions about local factors that would affect the outcome of the training projects were held with civic and business leaders in each area by members of BSSR's Study Team. From these discussions information was obtained concerning employment conditions in each area, hiring practices and preferences, skill requirements, etc. Thus, we knew a great deal about these projects and their setting, but the information we had was from the perspectives of the project personnel and people in what might be called the "power structure" of the local community.

To round out the picture of the projects, it was deemed necessary to view them from the perspective of the people they were designed to serve. This information was obtained through personal interviews by specially trained interviewers. The sampling plan called for interviewing all trainees and a sample of persons who applied for but who did not begin training. Interviewing took place from six to twelve months after the completion of training. The respondents were asked about their personal and economic situations at the time they applied for training in addition to their experiences with the training project and their current situation.

In most interviewing areas no experienced interviewers were available; pools of potential interviewers were formed through the recruitment efforts of BSSR field directors. Negro school teachers were the primary source in most areas. In all, more than one hundred and fifty interviewing recruits passed "screening," passed training, and conducted one or more interviews.

Interviewers underwent intensive training by BSSR field directors to locate the respondents whose addresses, although verified by the Post Office, were up to two years old--and to conduct the lengthy follow-up interview. Where respondents were concentrated, interviewers could be supervised locally; where respondents were scattered, interviewers were supervised by mail and phone from BSSR in Washington, D. C. In either case, all interviews were subjected to quality control procedures designed to yield a high level of completeness and consistency among responses. As a result item response rates are extremely high for all "critical" items in the schedules.

Approximately 2400 persons who applied for training at any of the projects were to be interviewed; completed interviews were obtained from about 1700, a response rate of over 70 per cent. About three-fourths of those who began training at any project were interviewed; the rate ranged among the projects from 53 per cent to 96 per cent. Response rates for those who applied for but who did not begin training were somewhat lower. The latter group, it should be noted, could provide a basis for evaluating the recruitment and selection procedures of the projects and, under special circumstances, could serve also as a control group with respect to the effectiveness of training.

The authorship of each individual report was assigned to a permanent staff member of BSSR who also was responsible for the analysis of the several bodies of information available about a project, but each report is also based upon the research contributions of many staff members of BSSR. The studies were under the over-all coordination of Dr. Robert T. Bower, Director, BSSR, with the assistance of Laure M. Sharp, Senior Research Associate. Leslie J. Silverman, Research Associate, was the Study Director, and, together with Mrs. Bettye K. Eidson and Miss N. March Hoffman, Research Analysts, designed the studies. The BSSR Study Team consisted of Dr. Frank Cotton, Mississippi State University; Dr. Lewis Jones, Fisk University; and Dr. Charles Grosser, New York University. Field operations for the trainee follow-up in Michigan were directed by Leslie J. Silverman and Gene B. Petersen. Dr. Samuel Lyerly designed the statistical procedures used in the various reports, and Richard Jones provided data processing consultation. Frank Davis supervised the coding operations and Miss Megan McLaughlin supervised the interviewers and the quality control

operation. Donald Goldstein was the programmer. Miss Diantha Stevenson and Miss Angeles Buenaventura also provided valuable assistance.

We are grateful to many individuals throughout the Manpower Administration of the Department of Labor who assisted us. Within OMPER, Mr. Robert Lafaso, our first project officer, and Mr. L. B. Wallerstein, who succeeded him, provided valuable guidance and met our requests in a most satisfactory manner.

We are grateful also to the directors and staffs of the training projects who cheerfully underwent so many hours of interviewing by BSSR staff. The helpfulness of employers of trainees, officials of state and local Employment Security Commission offices, and State Education Agencies is acknowledged and appreciated.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

FOREWORD iii

Chapter

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. CONTRACTUAL OBLIGATIONS OF THE MICHIGAN CATHOLIC CONFERENCE 2

- A. Demonstration Goals. 2
- B. Target Population. 2
- C. Contractual Responsibilities of Various Agencies . 3
- D. Staffing and Budget Commitments. 5

III. BACKGROUND AND ADMINISTRATION OF THE PROJECT 7

- A. Background 7
- B. Origin and Administration of the Project 11
- C. The Facilities of the Project. 13

IV. RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION. 16

- A. Methods of Recruitment 16
- B. Screening and Selection. 19
- C. Characteristics of Trainees and Applicants 23
- D. Evaluation of Recruitment. 41

V. TRAINING 44

- A. Basic Education. 44
- B. Vocational Training. 49
- C. On-the-Job Training. 55
- D. Completion of Training 57
- E. Counseling 63
- F. Auxiliary Services 65
- G. Summary. 67

VI. JOB DEVELOPMENT, PLACEMENT, AND FOLLOW-UP. 69

- A. Methods and Techniques 69
- B. Requirements for Employment. 72
- C. Follow-up. 76
- D. Analysis of Placement Activity 78

VII. LONG RANGE OUTCOME OF TRAINING 83

VIII. CONCLUSION: FEATURES AND CAPABILITIES DEMONSTRATED BY THE MICHIGAN CATHOLIC CONFERENCE. 94

I. INTRODUCTION

The present report covers the experience of the MDTA experimental and demonstration project operated by the Michigan Catholic Conference in Lansing, Michigan.

By definition, experimental and demonstration projects (E & D projects) are intended to experiment with special techniques and to devise new methods for solving the employment problems of the disadvantaged, particularly those problems which were not capable of solution by traditional methods such as those used in the regular retraining programs operated under the Manpower Development and Training Act (MDTA). The E & D projects are also intended to demonstrate to existing institutions that through these techniques, persons whom they considered to be untrainable and/or unemployable can, in fact, be trained for productive participation in the labor force.

In this report, we will describe first the contractual arrangements and obligations which governed the Michigan Project. A brief section follows which provides some relevant background information about economic and social conditions in Lansing and the place of the Michigan Catholic Conference in the community. Next, the way in which the main features of the contract--recruitment, training, counseling, and placement--were carried out, are reviewed in detail. We will conclude with an over-all evaluation of the capabilities demonstrated by the Michigan Catholic Conference.

The data on which this report is based were obtained through the methods and techniques described in the Foreword to this report.

II. CONTRACTUAL OBLIGATIONS OF THE MICHIGAN CATHOLIC CONFERENCE

A. Demonstration Goals

Under the terms of Contract No. MDS 14-64, the Michigan Catholic Conference, during the period February 1, 1964 to May 31, 1965, was to demonstrate that through special techniques, unskilled persons with little formal education, limited command of the English language (in particular, Spanish-speaking former migrants) can be successfully trained in occupations for which there is local demand, and placed after completion of training.

A second goal of the experimental and demonstration project was to bring about institutional change in the public employment and welfare agencies in Lansing, so that services to the hard core unemployed would be expanded and improved.

B. Target Population

The population for which the project was originally designed was the Spanish-speaking former migrants (farm workers) who had settled in and around Lansing.[1] Other disadvantaged groups, Negro and white, residing in the Tri-County area of Greater Lansing (Ingham, Clinton, and Eaton Counties) were also eligible. Among these groups, eligibility for selection was based on one or more of the following criteria: (1) trainees had to be between 19 and 60 years old, (2) unemployed with very little or no qualifying work experience, (3) 90 per cent of the trainees were to be heads of households or families; the remainder were to be youths between 19 and 21 years of age, (4) inability to speak, understand, or write English, and (5) lack of education, lack of work skills, and low income.

---

[1] The contract did not stipulate that these migrants had to be American citizens, and the BSSR follow-up did not inquire about citizenship.

C. Contractual Responsibilities of Various Agencies

The contractual agreement between the Michigan Catholic Conference and the Secretary of Labor assumed considerable participation by various state and local agencies. The following list summarizes the planned assignment of responsibilities:

Activity	Responsible Agency
Recruitment	Project, Employment Security Commission
Testing and selection	Project, Employment Security Commission Michigan State University
Counseling	Project, Employment Security Commission
Basic education	Michigan State University
Vocational education	Lansing Public Schools
Placement and follow-up	Project, Employment Security Commission

Recruitment.--The project staff was to recruit candidates for possible training from the target population described above. Names of eligible applicants would be obtained from the files of the Michigan Catholic Conference, the application files of the Michigan Employment Security Commission, welfare departments, and social and community agencies. In addition, the project staff would seek out trainees through personal visits to the homes of potential trainees and by referral from community agencies and leaders

Testing and selection.--An initial test, devised by the English Language Center of Michigan State University, was to be administered to potential trainees to determine their literacy levels for placement into homogeneous literacy groups. Trainees would then be intensively interviewed and given specially adapted tests. In addition, each potential trainee was to be given intensive individual vocational counseling.

A multifactored occupational and personal index was to be furnished the Michigan Employment Security Commission, which was assigned the responsibility for final selection, in consultation with the project staff and a representative of the Language Center of Michigan State University. One hundred and fifty trainees were to be selected from among the applicants recruited.

For persons who received testing and vocational counseling services, but were not selected for training, the Michigan Employment Security Commission was to provide placement or referral to MDTA, ARA, or other public training programs.

Counseling.--An orientation period of ten weeks was planned to prepare the trainee for subsequent on-the-job and institutional training. This period was also to be used for individual counseling with trainees. The trainees' time was to be divided between classroom presentations, visits to employment sites, and counseling. Thus, throughout the week, the trainees were to be exposed to audio-visual presentations--films, slides, maps, charts, tape recordings, and be taken on tours of establishments in which vocational training was to take place.

Furthermore, individual counseling services were to take place throughout the training period and up to three months after the end of training. These services were to be directed at assisting the trainees in adjusting to the demands of actual or potential jobs.

Basic education.--This phase of the training was outside the original scope of the contract with the Michigan Catholic Conference. Trainees were to be referred to Michigan State University for basic language and number skill instruction. However, because of failure to agree about financial arrangements, the University decided not to undertake this part of the training program. Consequently, the project staff had to handle this phase of the program.

Vocational training.--Originally, this phase of the program was to be the responsibility of the Lansing Public Schools. After the initial orientation and literacy training period, the trainees were to begin a second phase of the program comprising specific institutional or on-the-job training for a period of up to twenty weeks. Training was specified for five occupations: automobile mechanic helper, machine operator, janitor and maintenance man, bartender, and formal waiter. Literacy instruction, directly related to the skill classes, was to be continued as needed. However, one month before training was to begin, the Vocational Education Division of the Lansing Public Schools withdrew its participation. The contract with the Conference was then amended to enable the project staff, itself, to plan, develop, and conduct this phase of the training.

Job development, placement, and follow-up.--The Michigan Employment Security Commission and the project staff were to monitor all job openings to assure the swift placement of trainees. The job development and placement staff of the project were to follow up each trainee placed on a job or seeking employment for three months after the trainee completed his actual training.

D. Staffing and Budget Commitments

Staff.--According to the original plan, the project was to have a Program Director who, with the help of one administrative assistant, would direct the policies and procedures of the program, in consultation with the Michigan Employment Security Commission. A project counselor was to work closely with two Employment Security Commission counselors who were assigned to the project and who later provided excellent liaison between the two offices.

As the project evolved into a full scale training institution as a result of the nonparticipation by the university and the public schools, a teaching staff was recruited--11 instructors to handle cultural orientation and basic education and 4 to teach the vocational courses.

Budget.--The original budget for the project allocated a total of $523,802 of MDTA funds as follows:

Michigan Catholic Conference	$ 67,382
Employment Service	20,831
Institutional Training	435,589

In the absence of participation by the other agencies, all funds (except those for the Employment Service) were reallocated to the Michigan Catholic Conference which stayed within the budget as finally approved; expenditures were as follows:

Basic education		$ 92,798
Vocational training[2]		35,287
Clerk-typist	$11,585	
Auto mechanic	12,869	
Maintenance man	8,229	
Cashier	2,604	
Training allowances		308,500
Administrative costs and personnel		67,372
Total		$503,956

---

[2] Vocational training for three other occupations--nurses' aide, welder, and seamstress--was provided through regular MDTA programs at no charge to the project. However, training allowances for trainees in these courses came out of project funds.

III. BACKGROUND AND ADMINISTRATION OF THE PROJECT

A. Background

Any assessment of the effectiveness of the Michigan Catholic Conference as an experimental and demonstration project must take into account the social and political conditions prevailing in the Greater Lansing area during the first half of this decade. The outcomes of the training program also cannot be evaluated without allowing for the specific religious context in which the project activities were carried out.

Racial and political background.--During the period of training, Michigan had a Republican governor and two Democratic senators, all well known liberals. The political atmosphere was permissive with regard to training the disadvantaged minority groups. There was none of the political tension arising out of racial problems which has been so common in southern states. However, it would be wrong to conclude that there were no racial problems.

The population of the Greater Lansing area in 1965 was about 300,000. Approximately 7,500 were Negro and 6,000 Spanish-speaking. There was de facto segregation--the Negroes lived in the west side of the city, and in Lansing there was considerable opposition to integrated housing. There was no racial unrest; the minority groups were not only small, but they were unorganized. Negroes belonging to the NAACP in Lansing were considered "outsiders," belonging to the middle class and not really interested in the problems of the lower class Negroes. The Mexican-Americans were a more cohesive group; most of them lived in Northtown, and for all practical purposes had a community of their own. The church served as a focal unit with which they could identify, and the extended kinship group was the prevalent family structure.

De facto segregation among the races carries over into some of the occupations and created some problems for the job placement staff of the Job Training Center. For example, the job development officer had to hurdle race barriers in her efforts to place Negro graduates of two of the training occupations which were considered white-collar--cashier and clerk typist.

In general, however, where race or ethnicity was a barrier to entry, it did not come up as the sole or principal barrier to employment; it played a role in conjunction with other characteristics of the disadvantaged groups (education, age, previous work experience).

In sum, the Negroes and the Mexican-Americans were a political, as well as a numerical minority, and the effort to improve their social and economic situation presented no threat to any of the vested interests in Lansing.[3] This favorable climate undoubtedly had an impact on the outcomes of the training program.

Economic background.--Unlike some other areas where E & D projects are located, the Greater Lansing area is not a depressed area. It is sharing in the general prosperity which the United States has been experiencing since 1961. Its population has been increasing at an average annual rate of 2 per cent since 1960, which is higher than that for the United States as a whole (1.5%). The average annual income per household in 1964 was $7,700, as compared to the United States average of $7,100 per household.

---

[3] However, in the judgment of the BSSR study team, efforts to train those currently employed as seasonal agricultural workers does present a threat to vested interests in Michigan.

The labor force of the Greater Lansing area in 1965 was about 130,000 with 3,000 unemployed. Approximately 22 per cent of the persons in the labor force are employed by state, local, and federal government agencies and by schools and colleges. Michigan State University and state government agencies are the principal nonindustrial employers in the community. Farm workers account for 4 per cent of the labor force and business and industry (manufacturing, construction, transportation and communication, services) account for 72 per cent. Industry is diversified with the manufacture of motor vehicles and motor vehicle equipment predominating: the Oldsmobile and Fisher Body Divisions of General Motors Corporation employ about four fifths of the work force in this industry. In 1964 and 1965 there was a boom in the construction industry and, reportedly, any able bodied man could get a job.

Between 1963 and 1965, unemployment in Lansing was not only lower than in Michigan or in the United States as a whole, but it was also decreasing at a faster rate. Furthermore, nonagricultural employment was increasing faster, as shown below:

UNEMPLOYMENT RATES
(In Percentages)

Year	Greater Lansing	Michigan	United States
1963	4.2	5.7	5.7
1964	3.4	4.9	5.2
1965	2.2	4.0	4.6

Source: Bureau of Employment Security, Department of Labor

NONAGRICULTURAL EMPLOYMENT
(Thousands)

Year	Greater Lansing	Rate of Increase Per Cent	Michigan	Rate of Increase Per Cent	United States	Rate of Increase Per Cent
1963	97.7		2412.4		63,863.0	
1964	102.6	5.0	2518.1	4.4	65,596.0	2.7
1965	111.0	8.2	2673.9	6.2	67,594.0	3.0

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, Department of Labor

Against this background of affluence, one fact has to be considered. Of the 3,000 persons out of work in 1965, about 1,000 were described as hard core, chronically unemployed in a study made by the director of the Lansing office of the Michigan Employment Security Commission.

Religious background.--Since the sponsoring agency of the project was the Michigan Catholic Conference, the religious orientation of the undertaking was bound to raise questions, and various motivations were ascribed to the Job Training Center. At best, it was thought to be an effort to upgrade the social and economic situation of the deprived, unemployed Catholics in Lansing; at worst, it was suspected of using the training program to proselytize. An official in the State Department of Public Instruction, known to be hostile to the Job Training Center, commented to a member of the BSSR Study Team that, in the program, the Catholic Church saw an opportunity of receiving funds from OMAT to do the kind of work that they would, or should, ordinarily do on behalf of their parishioners.

The project staff tried their best to dispel this misunderstanding, which they knew could seriously undermine their program. The project was initially called the Michigan Catholic Conference Job Training Center; this was changed to just Job Training Center. A barrage of publicity emphasized the multiracial and predominantly non-Catholic composition of the group being trained, and this, plus the personal observations of the trainees themselves, allayed suspicions regarding this matter. It is interesting to note that in Greater Lansing about 12 per cent of the population are Catholic; approximately the same proportion of the trainees were Catholic.

B. Origin and Administration of the Project

This project, unlike others in this series being evaluated by the Bureau of Social Science Research, was not conducted by an established educational institution. It was conducted by the Michigan Catholic Conference, a private organization set up by the 5 Catholic bishops of Michigan in 1962 to demonstrate new educational and economic services which should be provided to people of any faith in the State of Michigan. While the Michigan Catholic Conference had the responsibility for the project, the Church itself had no connection with its operations.

The project began after the Executive Director of the Michigan Catholic Conference learned of OMAT's experimental and demonstration programs. He originally envisioned a basic literacy project for Mexican-Americans who had dropped out of the migrant work stream and had remained in the Lansing area as hard core unemployed or seriously underemployed workers. He urged the Catholic bishops to sponsor the project through the Michigan Catholic Conference. When they agreed, a thirteen member Citizens Advisory Committee, composed of prominent Michigan residents and officials, was named to aid in the development of the project. Lansing Community College, Michigan State University, and the Vocational Education Division of the Michigan Department of Public Instruction were consulted on curriculum problems. Out of discussions with OMAT, a broader project covering all nationalities was developed.

The Lansing project had the advantage of favorable relations with local people of significant political and professional influence. The director of the Lansing office of the Michigan Employment Security Commission was one of the originators of the project. He is a personal friend of the

Executive Director of Michigan Catholic Conference, whose wide connections were a distinct asset in matters relating to the several state agencies. In many cases, he was able to elicit their cooperation. For example, volunteers from the Community Services Council were very active in the provision of auxiliary services to the trainees and their families. Such services included tutoring, a nursery school program for the trainees' children, and a cultural orientation program for the trainees' wives. Also, the State welfare office was persuaded to speed up the disbursement of food and other allowances to the trainees who were eligible for them. Despite the strained relations between the project and the Division of Vocational Education of the Department of Public Instruction (see page 4), the project was able to obtain cooperation from this agency, although it deliberated six months before approving the program. It was finally constrained to do so largely because of the publicity and pressure "poured on" by the Michigan Catholic Conference.

The considerable resources and connections of the sponsoring organization, and its unquestioning backing of the project at all times, were of immense help. It made it possible for the project to take on a much larger leading role than had been originally planned. It also enabled the project to expand and diversify other services to trainees in response to felt needs, rather than in line with a precise blueprint. From what was originally merely a basic education scheme, the project grew into a broad comprehensive program, this metamorphosis taking place in an unplanned way. This could happen only because the project was free from organizational constraints and institutional traditions. The project director was responsible only to the Michigan Catholic Conference, and he and his assistant were given free rein as far as the administration of the project was concerned. The "laissez faire" atmosphere, coupled with an almost missionary zeal on the part of the project staff, enabled them to achieve a high degree of creativity and innovation in their attempts to provide the best kind of service for the trainees.

Not only did the project move from basic education to vocational training and job development but, in the process, it took on activities as varied as child care, homemaking, provision of emergency loans, attempts to secure low income public housing, etc. These services were not seen as ancillary to training. The program of day care for preschool children was not seen as primarily a necessity to enable mothers to take part in training. Rather, it was provided simply because the project staff felt that there would be value in it for the families of the trainees. Other services were added on an ad hoc basis until a comprehensive program evolved.

C. The Facilities of the Project

The physical plant.--The original administrative staff, which consisted of the program director, the administrative assistant, a secretary, an accountant, and two counselors, operated from the old (circa 1900) St. Mary's School building on North Walnut Street. The Job Training Center had 7 classrooms, administrative office space, counseling offices, instructors' preparation room, and a small library. Basic education, counseling, and some vocational training courses were conducted here. Most of the practical training courses in vocational skills were conducted elsewhere in Lansing. For example, the nurse-aide course was taught at Sparrow Hospital, a Lansing community hospital.

Thus, the Lansing setting did not offer the opportunities for informal, off-hours discussions, recreational activities, and participation in a wide variety of activities which would have been available on a university or college campus. The absence of an institutional atmosphere and the dispersion of training sites probably accounted for the disinterest, absenteeism, and lack of discipline on the part of some of the trainees. However, the lack of physical facilities was partly mitigated by the friendly, home-like atmosphere generated by the good personal relationships between the staff members and the trainees.

The instructional staff.--The BSSR Study Team felt that the teaching staff was devoted, hard working, and capable. Apparently, the director and some of the instructors were former public school personnel who felt that the structured rigidities of the conventional school could be overcome. The exigencies of working within a tight timetable (due to delays in funding) precluded recruitment of additional technically qualified personnel. A more important obstacle was the fact that the period for which instructors were being hired was fourteen months. Such temporary assignments are difficult to fill with qualified persons. From the bimonthly project reports which were submitted by the Job Training Center to OMAT, it appears that in the course of the training program, there was considerable turnover in the teaching staff.

As the program progressed, however, the instructors gained experience to the extent that the Lansing Community College was prepared to put on their payroll the entire basic education teaching staff of the Job Training Center should the College become the operating agency for a subsequent experimental and demonstration project.

The Community College had some reservations, however, about the vocational teachers. They felt that vocational courses, by their very nature, demanded a great deal of rigidity. The project staff felt that this was not necessarily so; they thought that all training, including vocational, should be people, rather than subject oriented. Their instructors and counselors were imbued with the philosophy that instruction should be entirely flexible, and should deal with the whole trainee. It is a moot question as to which is preferable--a highly qualified, albeit rigid, teacher, or one who may be less qualified but has the flexibility and the willingness to put aside even technical and academic requirements when a trainee's personal needs make this desirable. The ideal instructor would be the one who combines the two attributes in optimum amounts. Most of the Job Training Center instructors were primarily of the second type.

Should the Michigan Catholic Conference expand its program and become a manpower training agency serving the hard core unemployed, there seems to be no reason to doubt that any shortcomings still existing with respect to the temporary nature of its physical plant and its instructional staff could be easily remedied. The institution could without difficulty adapt some of the desirable features of permanent teaching institutions without sacrificing its flexibility and willingness to innovate. This conclusion seems to be valid, given the dedication to service and the resources (human, financial, political) of the sponsoring institution.

IV. RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION

Recruitment of the target population is perhaps the most critical task of any "hard core" training program. First, there is the problem of locating the population, as well as reaching it, i.e., getting program information across to them in a way which will motivate them to participate. The target population is usually isolated, not physically, since it is often found in the heart of big cities, but socially and psychologically, because of illiteracy, low income, and cultural deprivation. Furthermore, many of the hard core unemployed are not only isolated by their socioeconomic circumstances, but are psychologically alienated from the milieu in which they find themselves as a result of past defeats. Thus, the use of the usual news and communications media in recruitment will not be effective, and one of the functions of an experimental and demonstration project is to develop recruitment and information techniques which will work.

A. Methods of Recruitment

As in other phases of the project, the staff of the Job Training Center experimented with various methods of recruitment in trial and error fashion. The files of the Michigan Employment Security Commission were first scanned for low income, low education, unemployed persons. The Department of Social Welfare also made its files available to the recruiters. Call-in cards were made out to persons on the list thus collected. This method proved to be unsuccessful with the illiterate and with those distrustful of public agencies like the Employment Service.

Another method tried was the distribution of recruitment brochures. These were handed out to pastors of all the churches in the Greater Lansing area, to all school counselors, a Spanish-speaking recruitment committee, a NAACP recruiting committee, newspapers, radio and television stations, welfare workers, and many interested individuals. This technique also proved generally ineffectual, except with the pastor of Christo Rey parish, Father Faiver, who recruited many Spanish-speaking trainees.

The next step was active door-to-door recruitment, which was moderately successful, except among Negroes. The Negroes were apprehensive and suspicious, not only of government programs, but also of middle class members of their race. Finally, a Negro secretary at the Job Training Center gave a party at which she recruited about twenty applicants for the training program. This proved to be a breakthrough into the Negro community as the applicants spread information about the Center to their friends and relatives.

One advantage of the door-to-door technique was that it demonstrated to the target population that the recruiters were really interested in them as individuals and were willing to go out into the streets to meet them. However, the experience of the Job Training Center was that the most effective method of recruiting was the snowballing technique, trainees going out and talking to their friends about the program. At one time, the staff gave the trainees a Friday off to recruit; two or three prospects per trainee resulted. This added approximately one additional trainee accepted for each trainee previously in the program.

Those who came to the Job Training Center were asked how they had heard about the training program. Table 1 summarizes their answers. . .

TABLE 1

SOURCES OF INFORMATION ABOUT THE PROJECT BY ETHNICITY OF RESPONDENT

Source of Information	Percentages of Mentions by: Trainees				Applicants			
	W	N	SS	Total[a]	W	N	SS	Total[a]
Printed handouts	-	-	-	-	-	6	-	2
Radio, TV, newspapers	11	16	13	13	3	8	8	6
Friends, neighbors, relatives	25	58	52	44	19	39	46	33
Churches, ministers	5	-	33	14	5	3	12	6
Schools, not JTC	2	2	7	4	3	-	-	1
Welfare agency	18	4	11	12	8	6	8	7
Employment service	59	38	19	39	68	42	19	45
Other public agencies	2	-	-	*	-	-	-	-
Job Training Center	4	9	9	7	3	-	-	1
Other sources	5	-	2	3	-	-	4	1
(N)	(56)	(45)	(54)	(155)	(37)	(36)	(26)	(99)

The following terms and abbreviations are used throughout the tables in this report: Trainee: person who was accepted into training program; applicant: person who applied but did not begin training. W: white; N: Negro; SS: Spanish-speaking. In all tables reporting trainees by race or language group in this report the Spanish-speaking category includes four respondents classified by our interviewers as American Indian. Their inclusion in this category does not change the relative frequencies reported for the Spanish-speaking.

*Less than 1%

[a] The number of sources mentioned exceeds the number of respondents because some respondents mentioned more than one source.

It shows that the most common media of information about the project were friends, neighbors and relatives. The Employment Service ranked in second place, as a result of many mentions by white job seekers. Table 1 also confirms the report made by the project staff that Negroes and Spanish-speaking persons were best reached by word of mouth.

B. Screening and Selection

As specified by the contract, the project staff and the Michigan Employment Security Commission cooperated in the process of screening and selecting qualified trainees from among the applicants. The only deviation from the contractual agreement was that the project staff, rather than the Employment Security Commission, made the final selections.

The applicants had to go through a fairly detailed screening process, not only for the purpose of determining acceptance, but also to determine the type of training they were to receive if accepted. The first step in this process was an interview with a project counselor in the offices of the Employment Security Commission. As much essential information as possible about the applicant was collected in this interview and recorded on MESC Form 2511 (work experience) and D/L-D/HEW Form MT 101 (characteristics of trainees). From this interview, the counselor decided if the applicant was qualified for training, basing his judgment on the requirements set forth in the contract (see page 1).

If it appeared that the applicant was qualified for the program, he was then requested to report to the Job Training Center to take an English test for diagnostic purposes. About 25 per cent of the applicants failed to show up for the test, but this fact was disregarded when it came to accepting or refusing an applicant. MESC officials agreed to disregard all test scores because of the language difficulties of most applicants, and because of the problem of finding a culture free test which would be valid for all applicants. The personal interview, along with appraisal of school and/or work experience, was to be the basis for determination of an applicant's acceptability. Apart from demographic and educational data, other information gathered about the applicant was the extent of his urban work experience, whether or not he was culturally deprived or the product of a different culture, and whether he appeared to have some emotional or physical handicap.

During the first eight months of the project, more than 500 persons were recruited, interviewed, and counseled. Of these, 178 were accepted for training. Those who were not selected were referred to other training programs in the area, placed in jobs, or put on a "standby list" to be admitted as replacements for dropouts. Only 9 persons were rejected (not referred for training or placed in jobs) as they appeared to be uneducable or psychologically disturbed. The project reports make no mention of what further action, if any, was taken on behalf of these rejects.

Throughout this report, we are using the term "trainee" to refer to persons who applied, were accepted for, and participated in training, and the term "applicants" to refer to persons who applied and were not accepted for training, or who never participated despite acceptance. All trainees were to be interviewed; actually, 155 (out of the total group of 178), 87 per cent, were located and interviewed. In addition, a 50 per cent sample of applicants was to be interviewed. Of this sample, approximately half were actually interviewed, the others constituting a nonresponse group (unreachable, ill, died, etc.).

The bimonthly project report, issued by the Michigan Catholic Conference for October and November 1964, stated that 113 applicants (out of about 400) were referred to other types of training or to full-time employment. However, of the 99 applicants interviewed by the BSSR in 1966, only 18 reported that they were given this kind of service. This would indicate that less than 20 per cent (rather than closer to 30 per cent, as suggested by the project report) were given referrals. Two possible reasons for this discrepancy could be that (1) some respondents had forgotten referrals made for them, or (2) the survey, in which only about 25 per cent of the applicants were interviewed, included a disproportionate number of persons who had not received this service.

With regard to recruitment and selection, the project staff came to the following conclusions:

1. Written brochures mean very little to potential applicants; personal contact is extremely important. This procedure entails a lot of time and effort, but is absolutely necessary.

2. It is essential that at least one counselor be able to speak the language of the applicants. It is impossible to establish rapport where a language barrier exists. Fortunately, two of the project counselors were bilingual (Spanish and English).

3. Timing is crucial. A delay in the announced starting date of a program is very likely to be damaging to recruitment efforts. Recruitment should not be started too soon; first, all recruitment forces should be mobilized. It should then be possible to recruit within a matter of weeks.

4. Every aspect of the program which directly affects the trainee should be thoroughly spelled out to the applicant in a language he understands.

The recruiter should be aware that the educationally deprived person has a limited vocabulary. Terms like "basic education" and "vocational training" may be meaningless to some applicants.

5. Training allowances should be clearly explained to each applicant. It is best for the project not to make specific promises concerning allowances, since the final determination is made by the Employment Service. It may be better to tell the applicant that he will find out if he is eligible for the allowance once he is in training.

6. Most trainees who went through this program expressed an interest in a particular area of training which they talked about in the initial interview. Somehow, many of them got the impression that they would be accepted for training in the occupation they had in mind upon entering. However, to their disappointment, they had to be trained for other job skills in keeping with their aptitudes. Care must be taken not to give the impression that a trainee will receive training in his desired field if he is not qualified for it.

7. Physical examinations are essential for all potential trainees before entrance in a program; psychological or psychiatric examinations are necessary for some. Trainees' health needs must be attended to if the trainees are to gain maximum benefit from the training. If possible, this should be done before training begins. Serious emotional or psychological problems, however, cannot be solved adequately in a program designed for the teaching of basic education and occupational skills. Referrals must be made to other agencies for the remediation of these problems.

8. Finally, recruitment must be viewed as part of a large scope counseling operation. Efforts must be made to help the persons recruited with their personal problems, be they financial, emotional, or physical. Sympathy and a spirit of service must pervade the whole process since, in recruiting the hard core unemployed, the recruiter is dealing with people whose lives are filled with insecurity, doubt, and suspicion.

C. Characteristics of Trainees and Applicants

Residence and ethnic background.--In accordance with the contract, recruitment was conducted in the Greater Lansing area. The results of the survey show that 85 per cent of the respondents were residents of Ingham County (where Lansing is located) at the time they applied for training. The rest resided in neighboring counties.

The original intent of the project was to give training to Spanish-speaking former migrants who had settled in and around Lansing, a stopping place in the agricultural migrant stream. After approximately two months, 125 persons had been recruited. Of these, 80 were accepted for training; 75 of them were Spanish-speaking. The program was scheduled to start during the first week of April, but a delay in congressional appropriation of funds caused the beginning date to be moved to May 11. This proved to be disastrous as far as the original target population was concerned. While waiting for training to begin (a period of eight to ten weeks), about half of the selected Spanish-speaking persons found employment and were lost to the program. This employment was seasonal and lasted only up to the end of summer, by which time it was expected that these workers would again be unemployed. Since May was a difficult time of the year to attract migrants into the training program, recruitment was extended to eligible nonmigrant whites and

Negroes. This shift in the target population was necessary in order to recruit a sufficient number of trainees to carry on the program. Table 2 gives the months in which the respondents applied, showing that Negro trainees were relatively late entrants in the program. Among applicants, there is no appreciable difference between the races with regard to date of application. Over-all, however, a greater proportion of the applicants applied after June 1964.

TABLE 2

PERIOD OF APPLICATION, BY ETHNICITY

Time of Application	Ethnicity						Total	
	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Trainees	56	100.0[a]	45	100.0[a]	54	100.0[a]	155	100.0[a]
Jan.-Apr. 1964	16	28.6	8	17.8	13	24.1	37	23.9
May-June	29	51.8	21	46.7	32	59.2	82	52.9
After June[b]	10	17.8	16	35.5	9	16.7	35	22.6
NA[c]	1	1.8	-	-	-	-	1	0.6
Applicants	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0
Jan.-Apr. 1964	12	32.4	9	25.0	11	42.3	32	32.3
May-June	10	27.0	15	41.7	8	30.8	33	33.3
After June[b]	14	37.8	12	33.3	7	26.9	33	33.3
NA[c]	1	2.7	-	-	-	-	1	1.0

[a] In this and subsequent tables percentages may actually add to 99.9 or 100.1 per cent rather than 100.0 per cent due to rounding.

[b] This includes 7 trainees and 9 applicants who applied in 1965.

[c] In this and subsequent tables, the abbreviation NA stands for "no answer."

Table 3 shows that females accounted for approximately one third of the applicants and two fifths of the trainees. Among the whites, and to a lesser extent among the Spanish-speaking recruits, men greatly exceeded women.[4] On the other hand, among the Negro respondents, men were outnumbered two to one by the women. The project staff did not discriminate between the sexes in selecting the persons who were to be recruited and trained; Other characteristics besides sex were considered more important as a basis for selection. The difference between the sex ratios of the Negro group and the other two groups can be attributed to familial and cultural factors.

TABLE 3

TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS BY SEX AND ETHNICITY

	Trainees		Applicants	
	N	%	N	%
Total	155	100.0	99	100.0
Male				
White	48	31.0	32	32.3
Negro	16	10.3	12	12.1
Spanish-speaking	29	18.7	21	21.2
Total	93	60.0	65	65.6
Female				
White	8	5.2	5	5.0
Negro	29	18.7	24	24.2
Spanish-speaking	25	16.1	5	5.1
Total	62	40.0	34	34.3

---

[4] Four American Indians--3 men and 1 woman--have been included in the Spanish-speaking group.

Family status.--One of the contractual provisions specified that 90 per cent of those selected for training must be heads of households. Of the 155 trainee respondents, 108 were heads of households; 38 of these were women. Table 4 shows the percentage distribution of household heads by ethnicity and sex. More than one half (57%) of the female heads of households were Negro; 32 per cent were Spanish-speaking, and 11 per cent were white.

TABLE 4

HEADS OF HOUSEHOLD BY ETHNICITY AND SEX
(In Percentages)

Ethnicity	Sex		
	Male (N=70)	Female (N=38)	Both Sexes (N=108)
White	46.5	10.8	34.9
Spanish-speaking	33.8	32.4	33.9
Negro	19.7	56.8	31.2
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0

Table 5 shows in detail the distribution of family status by ethnicity and sex for trainees and applicants. Here, we find that a larger proportion of Negro women were heads of households--75 per cent as compared with 50 per cent and 52 per cent of the women in the other two racial groups. A comparison of the proportions of male and female household heads within each group shows that there is practically no difference in the Negro group (76.5% and 75.0%); in the other two groups, the difference between the sexes with regard to this characteristic is over 20 percentage points. This seems to bear out the preponderance of household heads among Negro females as compared to members of the same sex in the other 2 ethnic groups. Among the Negro applicants, only 3 out of 12 males were heads of households. The reverse held true for the white and Spanish-speaking groups.

TABLE 5

FAMILY STATUS OF TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS BY ETHNICITY AND SEX

Family Status	Ethnicity						Total	
	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Trainees								
Both Sexes	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
Head of household	38	67.9	34	75.6	37	68.5	109	70.3
Other	18	32.1	11	24.4	17	31.5	46	29.7
Male	48	100.0	17	100.0	29	100.0	94	100.0
Head of household	34	70.8	13	76.5	24	82.8	71	75.5
Other	14	29.2	4	23.5	5	17.2	23	24.5
Female	8	100.0	28	100.0	25	100.0	61	100.0
Head of household	4	50.0	21	75.0	13	52.0	38	62.3
Other	4	50.0	7	25.0	12	48.0	33	37.7
Applicants								
Both Sexes	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0
Head of household	26	70.3	13	36.1	20	76.9	59	59.6
Other	11	29.7	23	63.9	6	23.1	40	40.4
Male	32	100.0	12	100.0	21	100.0	65	100.0
Head of household	23	71.9	3	25.0	19	90.5	45	69.2
Other	9	28.1	9	75.0	2	9.5	20	30.8
Female	5	100.0	24	100.0	5	100.0	34	100.0
Head of household	3	60.0	10	41.7	1	20.0	14	41.2
Other	2	40.0	14	58.3	4	80.0	20	58.8

Over-all, a comparison between trainees and applicants shows that the proportion of heads of households is greater among the trainees, whether we are looking at men, women, or both sexes together. Obviously, one of the important reasons for nonacceptance of applicants into the program was the head of household criterion.

Cultural factors.--Although it is believed that lack of head of household status was one of the main reasons for the relatively low numbers of Negro men in the program, it can be hypothesized that cultural factors are also operative in the difficulties experienced with recruiting Negro males in Lansing. As has been suggested by many studies of the problem of poverty among Negroes, one of the key elements is the social position of the Negro male. In a society which presumes male leadership, the Negro family does not generally follow this pattern, according to these hypotheses. Not only does this situation disqualify some of the men from participating in projects which require head of household status, it affects recruitment by making the Negro exceptionally hard to reach. As a result of their marginal social position, many of the disadvantaged Negro men may have developed a defensive and negative attitude toward activities like training programs, with their connotations of "going back to school," dependence on authority, and other status diminishing attributes.

Marital status.--Like other disadvantaged populations, the Lansing trainees and applicants included a fairly large number of women who were household heads; most of them had been deserted by their husbands. To some extent, this is likely to be the case whenever recruitment is partly based on welfare referrals, since the desertion of wives is actually encouraged by welfare regulations which require that no male breadwinner be living with a woman who is receiving public assistance. Table 6 shows that the proportion of Negro women who were separated, widowed, or divorced was larger than that in the other two groups. More than half of both trainees and applicants were married; in both groups, a larger proportion of men were married than women.

TABLE 6

MARITAL STATUS OF TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS BY ETHNICITY AND SEX

Marital Status	Ethnicity						Total	
	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
				Trainees				
Both Sexes	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
Married	36	64.3	18	40.0	36	66.7	90	58.1
Single	15	26.8	5	11.1	7	13.0	27	17.4
Other[a]	5	8.9	22	48.9	11	20.3	38	24.5
Male	48	100.0	17	100.0	29	100.0	94	100.0
Married	31	64.6	12	70.6	26	89.7	69	73.4
Single	14	29.2	-	-	2	6.9	16	17.0
Other[a]	3	6.2	5	29.4	1	3.4	9	9.6
Female	8	100.0	28	100.0	25	100.0	61	100.0
Married	5	62.5	6	21.4	10	40.0	21	34.4
Single	1	12.5	5	17.9	5	20.0	11	18.0
Other[a]	2	25.0	17	60.7	10	40.0	29	47.6
				Applicants				
Both Sexes	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0
Married	22	59.5	15	41.7	18	69.2	55	55.6
Single	10	27.0	8	22.2	3	11.5	21	21.2
Other[a]	5	13.5	13	36.1	5	19.3	23	23.2
Male	32	100.0	12	100.0	21	100.0	65	100.0
Married	20	62.5	3	25.0	15	71.4	38	58.5
Single	10	31.2	5	41.7	3	14.3	18	27.7
Other[a]	2	6.3	4	33.3	3	14.3	9	13.8
Female	5	100.0	24	100.0	5	100.0	34	100.0
Married	2	40.0	12	50.0	3	60.0	17	50.0
Single	-	-	3	12.5	-	-	3	8.8
Other[a]	3	60.0	9	37.5	2	40.0	14	41.2

[a] Includes respondents who are separated, widowed, or divorced.

Age.--A comparison of trainees and applicants shows that, on the whole, the applicants were younger than the trainees (Tables 7a, 7b, 7c). This probably reflects the concentration of project efforts on older unemployed workers. Among Negro male trainees, the proportion of those over 45 is especially high (7 out of 16 trainees).

TABLE 7a

AGE BY ETHNICITY AND SEX
(Trainees)

Age	Ethnicity						Total	
	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Both Sexes	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
Under 21	15	26.8	7	15.6	10	18.5	32	20.7
22-44	35	62.5	30	66.6	32	59.2	97	62.6
45-54	4	7.1	5	11.1	5	9.3	14	9.0
55 and over	1	1.8	3	6.7	7	13.0	11	7.1
NA	1	1.8	-	-	-	-	1	6.5
Male	48	100.0	16	100.0	29	100.0	93	100.0
Under 21	12	25.0	2	12.5	6	20.7	20	21.5
22-44	31	64.6	7	43.7	18	62.0	56	60.2
45-54	4	8.3	5	31.2	1	3.5	10	10.7
55 and over	-	-	2	12.5	4	13.8	6	6.5
NA	1	2.1	-	-	-	-	1	1.1
Female	8	100.0	29	100.0	25	100.0	62	100.0
Under 21	3	37.4	5	17.2	4	16.0	12	19.4
22-44	4	50.0	23	79.3	14	56.0	41	66.1
45-54	-	-	-	-	4	16.0	4	6.4
55 and over	1	12.5	1	3.5	3	12.0	5	8.1

TABLE 7b

AGE BY ETHNICITY AND SEX
(Applicants)

	Ethnicity						Total	
Age	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Both Sexes	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0
Under 21	10	27.0	11	30.6	4	15.4	25	25.3
22-44	18	48.7	20	55.6	16	61.5	54	54.5
45-54	8	21.6	4	11.1	4	15.4	16	16.2
55 and over	1	2.7	1	2.7	1	3.8	3	3.0
NA	-	-	-	-	1	3.8	1	1.0
Male	32	100.0	12	100.0	21	100.0	65	100.0
Under 21	10	31.2	5	41.7	2	9.5	17	26.1
22-44	16	50.0	6	50.0	13	62.0	35	53.9
45-54	5	15.6	1	8.3	4	19.0	10	15.4
55 and over	1	3.2	-	-	1	4.8	2	3.1
NA	-	-	-	-	1	4.8	1	1.5
Female	5	100.0	24	100.0	5	100.0	34	100.0
Under 21	-	-	6	25.0	2	40.0	8	23.5
22-44	2	40.0	14	58.3	3	60.0	19	55.9
45-54	3	60.0	3	12.5	-	-	6	17.6
55 and over	-	-	1	4.2	-	-	1	3.0

TABLE 7c

MEDIAN AGE BY ETHNICITY AND SEX

Ethnicity	Age in Years		
	Male	Female	Both Sexes
All Trainees	34	32	33
White	30	28	30
Negro	43	31	35
Spanish-speaking	33	36	34
All Applicants	28	29	29
White	25	48	27
Negro	24	29	28
Spanish-speaking	33	27	31

Education.--The recruitment efforts of the project came very close to the stated goal of seeking out the educationally deprived. About 86 per cent of the trainees and 82 per cent of the applicants had completed fewer than twelve grades. Furthermore, the actual distribution of grade completion shown in Table 8 overstates the real educational capabilities of applicants and trainees. Tests and interviews conducted during the screening process showed that a majority of those tested were placed at sixth grade or lower. Table 8 also shows that a higher proportion of trainees than applicants had completed fewer than eight grades, and that low levels of education were especially prevalent among Spanish-speaking persons. The low level of educational achievement underlies the importance placed on basic education by the project.

TABLE 8

HIGHEST GRADE COMPLETED BY TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS

Grades Completed	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
				Trainees				
All grades	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
Less than 8	23	41.1	18	40.0	32	59.2	73	47.1
8	14	25.0	9	20.0	9	16.7	32	20.6
9-11	13	23.2	9	20.0	6	11.1	28	18.1
12	5	8.9	9	20.0	4	7.4	18	11.6
13 and over	-	-	-	-	3	5.6	3	1.9
NA	1	1.8	-	-	-	-	1	0.6
				Applicants				
All grades	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0
Less than 8	12	32.4	9	25.0	14	53.8	35	35.3
8	9	24.3	4	11.1	3	11.5	16	16.2
9-11	13	35.2	13	36.1	4	15.4	30	30.3
12	3	8.1	10	27.8	2	7.7	15	15.2
13 and over	-	-	-	-	2	7.7	2	2.0
NA	-	-	-	-	1	3.9	1	1.0

Place of birth.--Although the project was originally intended for migrants who had settled in or around Lansing, subsequent modifications eliminated migrant status as a criterion for acceptance. Nevertheless, as Table 9 shows, over half of all trainees were born neither in Michigan nor in nearby states. Only among whites was the majority born in Michigan. Most of the Negroes were born in "nonneighboring states"; the interview schedules showed that most of them had come from Mississippi, Alabama, and Tennessee. Only about one third of the Spanish-speaking group were foreign born, while almost one half were born in "nonneighboring states" (the interview schedules showed that Texas was the state in which the majority were born).

TABLE 9

PLACE OF BIRTH OF TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS

Place of Birth	Race: White N	White %	Negro N	Negro %	Spanish-Speaking N	Spanish-Speaking %	Total N	Total %
Trainees								
Michigan	42	75.0	6	13.3	8	14.8	56	36.1
Neighboring state	2	4.0	-	-	-	-	2	1.3
Nonneighboring state	10	18.0	37	82.2	26	48.2	73	47.1
Foreign country	-	-	1	2.2	19	35.2	20	12.9
NA	2	4.0	1	2.2	1	1.8	4	2.6
Total	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
Applicants								
Michigan	23	62.2	7	19.4	6	23.1	36	36.4
Neighboring state	1	2.7	1	2.8	-	-	2	2.0
Nonneighboring state	11	29.7	27	75.0	10	38.5	48	48.5
Foreign country	2	5.4	-	-	9	34.6	11	11.1
NA	-	-	1	2.8	1	3.8	2	2.0
Total	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0

Primary occupational category.--The bulk of trainees and applicants had previously held unskilled jobs--as service workers and laborers. Table 10 shows that only one of the Negro trainees had been a farm laborer in the 12-month period before applying to the project, as compared with 16 per cent and 22 per cent of the white and Spanish-speaking trainees respectively who were in farming occupations during the same period. Conversely, the table also shows that half (50%) of the Negro trainees and an even larger proportion of Negro applicants (64%) had been employed in service occupations as maids, kitchen workers, cleaning women, janitors, and private household workers. It was found that 30 per cent of the white applicants had been craftsmen--usually a skilled occupation--while only 9 per cent of the whites starting training were so qualified.

Seven of the 54 Spanish-speaking respondents had never worked before; 5 of these were women who, in keeping with their cultural tradition, had never worked outside the home.[5] Among all the applicants, on the other hand, only 1 Negro had never worked before.

Three of the Spanish-speaking respondents were classified as being in the professional/technical category, which would normally make them ineligible for the project. It should be noted that these three were Cuban refugees (two pharmacists and a mathematics teacher) who joined the program only to learn how to read and write English.

---

[5] It turned out that these women were among those not working when interviewed one year after the end of training.

TABLE 10

PRIMARY OCCUPATIONAL CATEGORY OF TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS

Primary Occupational Category	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
				TRAINEES				
Professional and technical	-	-	-	-	3	5.6	3	1.9
Clerical and sales	1	1.8	3	6.7	2	3.7	6	3.9
Craftsmen and foremen	5	8.9	3	6.7	5	9.2	13	8.4
Operatives	7	12.5	6	13.3	5	9.2	18	11.6
Service	16	28.6	22	48.9	11	20.4	49	31.6
Laborers, except farm	12	21.4	5	11.1	9	16.7	26	16.8
Farm laborers	9	16.1	1	2.2	12	22.2	22	14.2
Never worked	3	5.4	4	8.9	7	13.0	14	9.0
Other[a]	3	5.4	1	2.2	-	-	4	2.6
Total	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
				APPLICANTS				
Professional and technical	1	2.7	-	-	-	-	1	1.0
Clerical and sales	2	5.4	2	5.6	-	-	4	4.0
Craftsmen and foremen	11	29.8	1	2.8	2	7.7	14	14.1
Operatives	8	21.6	6	16.7	1	3.9	15	15.2
Service	5	13.5	23	63.9	7	26.9	35	35.4
Laborers, except farm	2	5.4	-	-	5	19.2	7	7.1
Farm laborers	7	18.9	3	8.3	8	30.8	18	18.2
Never worked	-	-	1	2.7	-	-	1	1.0
Others[a]	1	2.7	-	-	3	11.5	4	4.0
Total	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0

[a] Includes students, and persons whose occupations could not be ascertained.

Income.--The target group was to be a low income population and the data in Table 11 leave little doubt that this criterion was met. Trainees had lower incomes than applicants. Among whites, 30 per cent of the applicants but only 8 per cent of the trainees, had incomes of $3000 or more. In the Spanish-speaking groups, 50 per cent of the trainees had incomes of less than $2000, as compared to 35 per cent of the applicants.

TABLE 11

INCOME OF TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS FROM JOBS HELD DURING THE 12-MONTH PERIOD PRECEDING APPLICATION

Income	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
				Trainees				
None	13	23.2	9	20.0	16	29.6	38	24.5
Under $1000	11	19.6	8	17.8	14	25.9	33	21.3
$1000 to $1999	9	16.1	9	20.0	13	24.1	31	20.0
$2000 to $2999	11	19.6	7	15.6	3	5.6	21	13.6
$3000 and over	8	14.3	10	22.2	5	9.2	23	14.8
NA	4	7.2	2	4.4	3	5.6	9	5.8
Total	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
				Applicants				
None	9	24.3	4	11.1	6	23.1	19	19.2
Under $1000	6	16.2	9	25.0	1	3.8	16	16.2
$1000 to $1999	6	16.2	9	25.0	8	30.8	23	23.2
$2000 to $2999	3	8.1	8	22.2	3	11.6	14	14.1
$3000 and over	11	29.8	6	16.7	7	26.9	24	24.2
NA	2	5.4	-	-	1	3.8	3	3.1
Total	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0

The income of 23 trainees exceeded $3000; it was found that many of these trainees had held 3 or more jobs during the year. The 5 Spanish-speaking trainees in this group had held well-paying jobs in Cuba and Argentina before migrating to the United States. One trainee earned $8000 during this period from gambling, a source of income which dried up when police broke up the gambling ring.

Trainee median family income from all sources was $3250 for the 12 months preceding application (see Table 12). An average of 4 persons lived off that amount of income during the year. Among the applicants, the corresponding figures are $3562 and 4 persons. Thus, in terms of family income compared to family size, the recruits clearly fall into the low income category.

TABLE 12

FAMILY INCOME OF TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS FOR THE 12-MONTH PERIOD PRECEDING APPLICATION

Family Income	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
				Trainees				
Less than $3000	19	33.9	12	26.7	26	48.2	57	36.8
$3000 to $3999	8	14.3	11	24.4	6	11.1	25	16.1
$4000 and over	17	30.4	16	35.6	12	22.2	45	29.0
NA	12	21.4	6	13.3	10	18.5	28	18.1
Total	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
				Applicants				
Less than $3000	11	29.7	8	22.2	8	30.8	27	27.3
$3000 to $3999	8	21.6	8	22.2	5	19.2	21	21.2
$4000 and over	11	29.7	15	41.7	8	30.8	34	34.3
NA	7	18.9	5	13.9	5	19.2	17	17.2
Total	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0

Length of unemployment.--Applicants and trainees were also asked how long they had been unemployed during the preceding 12-month period. About a third of the trainees had been unemployed for more than 6 months, while approximately one fourth had not been unemployed at all. All 3 groups seemed to follow this pattern, with about three fourths of the trainees having been unemployed at some time or other during this 12-month period.

Only about one fifth of the applicants had been unemployed for more than 6 months as compared to one third of the trainees. Unlike the trainees, however, the patterns of unemployment among applicants differed among the ethnic groups. Only 16 per cent of the white applicants had never been unemployed, while almost one half (46%) of the Spanish-speaking applicants were in this category.

In general, Table 13 suggests that, in selecting the trainees from among the applicants, the project staff gave priority to those who had been unemployed for longer periods of time.

Incidence of disability.--One final topic will be mentioned--the high proportion of trainees who suffered from physical, mental, or emotional disabilities. Table 14 shows that about two fifths of the trainees had some kind of disability, the incidence in the non-Spanish-speaking white group being considerably higher than in the others. It is probably not too far fetched to speculate that in the case of this group, the project really scraped the bottom of the barrel. The high proportion of disabled trainees highlights again the fact that recruitment was aimed at the very disadvantaged portion of the population and that it succeeded in reaching them.

TABLE 13

LENGTH OF UNEMPLOYMENT FOR TRAINEES AND APPLICANTS IN THE 12-MONTH PERIOD BEFORE APPLICATION

Number of Months Unemployed	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Trainees								
Zero	15	26.8	14	31.1	14	25.9	43	27.7
1-3	16	28.6	10	22.2	11	20.4	37	23.9
4-6	4	7.1	5	11.1	7	13.0	16	10.3
7-12	20	35.7	14	32.1	21	38.9	55	35.5
NA	1	1.8	2	4.5	1	1.9	4	2.6
Total	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
Applicants								
Zero	6	16.2	13	36.1	12	46.2	31	31.3
1-3	5	40.5	11	30.5	4	15.4	30	30.3
4-6	6	16.2	6	16.7	4	15.4	16	16.2
7-12	9	24.3	5	13.9	6	23.1	20	20.2
NA	1	2.7	1	2.8	-	-	2	2.0
Total	37	100.0	36	100.0	26	100.0	99	100.0

TABLE 14

INCIDENCE OF PHYSICAL, MENTAL OR EMOTIONAL DISABILITY (Trainees)

Disability	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Physical	13	23.2	9	20.0	8	14.8	30	19.4
Mental or emotional	19	33.9	10	22.2	5	9.3	34	21.9
None	24	42.9	26	57.8	41	75.9	91	58.7
Total	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0

D. Evaluation of Recruitment

The data in this section show clearly that the project did an excellent job in seeking out the target population to which it had committed itself. The trainees who were accepted into the program were older and less educated than the applicants. They had also been unemployed longer, had lower incomes, and included a larger proportion of household heads. Further, both trainees and applicants were more disadvantaged in the above respects than were trainees in regular MDTA training programs in 1964. A comparison with the characteristics of institutional trainees in the regular MDTA programs across the nation in 1964 shows that the Michigan Catholic Conference E & D project succeeded in making contact with and serving a larger proportion of the hard core unemployed--the older workers, those with inadequate schooling, and the long term (more than 6 months) unemployed. Table 15 compares the MDTA trainees and the Michigan Catholic Conference trainees and applicants with respect to these characteristics. It shows that the MCC trainees and applicants included a larger proportion of older workers (45 years or over). While the regular MDTA trainees had completed twelve grades on the average, the MCC respondents had completed only eight grades, and almost one half (47%) of the MCC trainees had had even fewer years of education. The most glaring difference, however, was in the length of unemployment in the 12-month period before training. About half of the regular MDTA trainees had been unemployed for 2 or 3 months, but the same proportion of MCC trainees had been unemployed for more than 6 months.

TABLE 15

REGULAR MDTA TRAINEES, MCC TRAINEES AND MCC APPLICANTS BY SELECTED CHARACTERISTICS, 1964

(In Percentages)

Characteristics	Regular MDTA Project[a] Trainees (N=67,988)	MCC Project Trainees (N=155)	MCC Project Applicants (N=99)
Age in Years			
Less than 21	37.6	20.8	25.5
22-34	34.6[b]	34.4[b]	42.9[b]
35-44	16.9	28.6	12.2
45 and over	10.9	16.2	19.4
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0
Education			
Less than 8th grade	7.0	47.1	35.3
8th grade	8.8	20.6[b]	16.2[b]
9th to 11th grade	31.3	18.1	30.3
12th grade	46.2[b]	11.6	15.2
Over 12th grade	6.7	1.9	2.0
NA	-	0.7	1.0
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0
Duration of Unemployment of those who were Unemployed			
1 month or less	30.5	12.0	15.2
2 to 3 months	23.4[b]	22.2	30.3
4 to 6 months	13.2	14.8	24.2[b]
More than 6 months	32.9	50.9[b]	30.3
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0

[a] Source: Manpower Research and Training, a Report by the Secretary of Labor, March 1965.

[b] Indicates the interval where the medians of the various characteristics lie.

In sum, the recruitment efforts missed the target population only in one respect: it could not recruit 150 Spanish-speaking migrants because of funding delays. It then turned its recruitment effort to the white and Negro populations. Those selected from these groups not only possessed the characteristics mentioned above, but also suffered frequently from physical, mental, or emotional disabilities.

Thus, it may be concluded that the project reached out and did succeed in recruiting the disadvantaged hard core unemployed. No creaming was done, and any evaluation of the outcome of the training program must keep this fact in mind.

V. TRAINING

The outstanding feature of the training given by the project was that it evolved according to the needs of the trainees. There was minimal planning, partly due to lack of time, and partly due to inexperience of the staff. This, in conjunction with the "philosophy" of the program, led to a loosely structured program, with a high degree of flexibility, both in curriculum and methods; the ingenuity and resourcefulness of both teachers and counselors were constantly put to the test in dealing with the needs of the trainees, and frequent changes and adaptations were introduced. This approach worked to the advantage of many trainees who might not have been able to function in a more conventional, rigid program. But, it also resulted in less than satisfactory results, as the lack of planning led to unnecessary waste of time and effort, and the relative inexperience of the staff "hindered the progress we might have made if we had known where we were going," as the project director put it.

Training consisted of two parts: basic education and vocational training. Some trainees took only basic education, while the rest moved on to vocational training after completing the basic education part of the program. The following sections describe the courses taught and other activities ancillary to training.

A. Basic Education

Phasing and length of course.--Basic education was to be given to all trainees.[6] They were initially divided into 4 groups by level of general educational skill. The length of time each trainee was in basic education varied from 10 to 52 weeks, depending on his needs. The curriculum included cultural orientation, reading, penmanship, arithmetic and manual dexterity. As the trainees reached a certain level of development, they were moved from one basic education group to the next. This gave them a sense of accomplishment as they moved up. However, the promotion of trainees from basic education into vocational skills training was often less smooth and led at times to a sense of confusion and disappointment. In many cases, trainees felt that they were not ready for the skills training and that they were being pulled prematurely out of the basic education program. In other cases, the trainees were not able to enroll in the skill area of their preference. Some of these situations were caused by the phasing of the vocational program. Thus, some trainees were pulled out of basic education prematurely because they would otherwise miss the opportunity to start a skill course. In at least two cases which involved trainees for welding, the men participated only in basic education because by the time they had completed this part there was no welding course available. In a few cases, some trainees were retained in basic education far too long while waiting for on-the-job training positions which never materialized.

---

[6] Altogether, there were 4 exceptions to this--2 in the cashier course and 2 in the OJT group. These trainees did not need basic education.

Cultural orientation.--This course was given for 2 hours a day during the first 20 weeks of the program and provided exposure to a variety of topics about which the teaching staff felt the trainees needed to be informed as an introduction to the world of work and other segments of life in which most of them had been relatively uninvolved. The staff felt that this part of the program contributed substantially to the interest and motivation of the trainees. It rounded out their education since many of them were either culturally deprived or had grown up in a culture quite different from that of the urban milieu in which they found themselves.

Several of the staff pointed out that on balance and after some initial difficulties, the racial and national mixture of the trainees worked to the advantage of the program.

Teaching techniques.--Several techniques were used in the basic education program--the Edex teaching machine, materials from the Skills Center, and the Bell and Howell Language Masters for drilling nonreaders in sight words, and Spanish-speaking persons in the English language and in mathematics concepts. However, the instructors found these materials inadequate for those trainees who had completed less than 4 years of schooling. They felt that with this group the traditional approach was more effective. In keeping with their philosophy of suiting instruction to the students' needs, the teachers developed their own materials and visual aids for this low literacy group.

Adequacy of training in basic education.--Opinions were mixed concerning the adequacy of training in basic education. Some employers felt it was adequate; others did not, and there were more in the latter group than in the former. The instructors themselves thought that the time allotted to basic reading, writing and communications skills (4 hours a day) was excessive; it strained the ability of the trainees to concentrate. This brings up the question of whether or not basic education should be integrated with vocational training, rather than precede it, thus resulting in the division of the whole program into two separate blocks. Certainly, a mixed program would provide more variety in the course of the 8-hour day. It would also have the advantage of preserving integration between the subject matter taught in basic education and the vocational course the trainee is taking. Counseling, too, might benefit from integration of the basic education and vocational areas. As it was, orientation counseling (which went with basic education) was reduced to a minimum or completely stopped as soon as the trainee "graduated" to a skills training course, although it became clear that counseling was still very much needed at that point.

When the trainees were asked to state their opinions about the basic education part of the course, they generally gave favorable comments. In answer to the question "Was the basic education training you got mostly to make you a better reader or was it mostly to help you to learn the work skills?" there were approximately equal numbers of responses for each of three possible answers, distributed in the following manner:

	Per Cent
Mostly a better reader	30.0
Mostly to learn work skills	32.1
Both	34.3
Did not get basic education	3.6

When asked about the necessity for basic education, 57.6 per cent answered "No" to the question "Do you feel that you would have learned the work skills in which you were being trained just as well without the basic education training?" The respondents reacted this way:

No, not further specified	15.7%
No, work skills required knowledge of basic education	41.9
Yes, not further specified	14.2
Yes, already knew how to read and write	12.9
Yes, already knew the work skills	3.9
Did not get basic education	3.6
No answer given	7.8

The respondents were also asked if they thought employers would consider training in basic education a substitute for a high school diploma. The following answers were given:

	Per Cent
No	25.1
Yes	52.2
Don't know	22.7

Those who gave reasons for their "No" answers said that a high school diploma is an inflexible criterion for most employers, or that employers considered the training in basic education to be insufficient. Among those who answered "Yes," however, 16 respondents said that many employers gave precedence to work skills over basic education when hiring workers. One respondent volunteered that employers hired the program graduates because they could be paid lower wages.

When asked if the training in basic education was helpful in other ways, only 33 respondents (21.3%) answered "No." Of those who answered "Yes," by far the greatest proportion said it helped them to read, write, speak English, and do mathematics work better. They also indicated that this training had made them socially more competent, helped them to plan more effectively for their families, and increased their ability to get along in the world of work. These answers suggest that the cultural orientation part of the training was indeed effective.

In general, members of the various racial groups did not differ in the answers given. However, in their general evaluation of the program, many Spanish-speaking respondents felt that the teaching of the English language would have been vastly improved if it had been taught by a Spanish-speaking or Latin American teacher. Bilingual instructors were employed on the second project.

On the basis of these various items of information, we feel that we should rate the training in basic education as fair. On the plus side, we might mention flexibility, ingenuity in the use of materials and methods, the manner in which the instructors were keenly attuned to the needs and problems of the trainees, and the fact that the trainees themselves perceived the training as valuable. On the minus side, there is lack of planning, frequent changes in instructors, and the separation of basic education and vocational training into two separate blocks.

B. Vocational Training

Description of the courses.--The several skills programs were started at different times. Four of them were taught by the Job Training Center: cashier, clerk-typist, auto mechanics helper, and custodial maintenance. In addition, a number of trainees were placed in skills training programs outside the Center: in 2 regular MDTA training courses for welders and seamstresses at Lansing Community College, and in a nurses' aide training program at a local hospital. During the last 2 or 3 weeks of the skills training at the Center, each of the trainees was placed in an on-the-job training situation in some local establishment to provide a realistic final phase of the training.

All the occupations for which the training was given seemed to be appropriate in terms of the labor market and employment patterns in Lansing, and in terms of the capabilities of the trainees themselves. The labor market situation was such that job training for the 2 principal industries in Lansing--the manufacture of motor vehicles and the service industries--was warranted. Auto mechanics, welders, nurses' aides, janitors, clerk-typists, and cashiers were certainly in demand. Further, all the occupations were entry level and nontechnical in nature. This was in keeping with the aptitudes of the trainees, given their extremely limited educational background and work experience. The following sections describe in detail the occupations for which training was given.

1. Cashier.--This program was 6 weeks in length, 5 of which were devoted to classroom instruction and the sixth to experience in grocery stores. The 5 weeks included arithmetic, operation of cash registers and changing of tapes, English, telephone answering, customer relations, grooming, human relations, and retail selling. According to the instructor, 50 hours were devoted to arithmetic and 25 hours to English. This indicates that considerable time was devoted to basic education subjects, in part because the basic education program was not being conducted simultaneously with vocational training and, therefore, could not teach the communications and mathematical skills needed specifically in cashier training.

The instructor felt that, of the 8 trainees who completed the program, 6 were qualified to be placed as cashiers. Nevertheless, one employer who hired 3 graduates felt that only one of the 3 was well prepared and well trained. He stated that it takes a quick mind for this type of work, partly because of the situations which the cashier must handle, such as price switching, quick change artists, etc. He said that one person failed completely; another failed as a cashier and was switched to a less demanding job where she succeeded; and 1 was exceedingly good as a cashier. He concluded that the technical training as such was not inadequate: the trouble was the improper selection of candidates for training.

2. Clerk-typist.--This program lasted 20 weeks. The staff considered this to be inadequate and their conclusion was reinforced by employers who also felt that more training would have placed the graduates in a much better competitive position in the labor market.

This program included typing, filing, English, and operation of business machines. The instructor said that most students were able to type about 25 words per minute at the end of the course. She felt that the program should have been longer so that the trainees could have been better prepared for entry into the job market, where the required typing speed is usually 50 words per minute. The program director also felt that the course should have lasted 40 weeks. The project tried to help the graduates of the course by making machines available to them for practice, and urging them to enroll in night school.

3. Auto mechanics.--This course lasted 20 weeks which, again, was not long enough. The program, in general, was a failure, with only 2 or 3 of those who completed the course having learned enough to succeed in entering training related work. This program was conducted in a garage located at some distance from the Job Training Center, and counseling and direction by the project staff practically ended when the skills training began. As a result, the program was carried on in a rather undisciplined and turbulent atmosphere. The instructor, the owner of the garage, knew his business, although his teaching techniques and his disciplinary methods left something to be desired. He could not control the trainees, and his facilities were less than adequate for the program. The garage was too cramped and, with business going on as usual, the atmosphere was not conducive to learning. Furthermore, there was not enough equipment. Trainees were prohibited by law from working on customers' cars if the owner was making a profit on the transaction.

All these deficiencies were corroborated by the trainees, who cited lack of discipline, lack of equipment, and cramped quarters as reasons why the program, in their opinion, was not a success.

4. Custodial maintenance.--Each of the 2 programs in custodial maintenance lasted for 10 weeks. The instructor was well prepared and knew the field very well. Although he covered the general areas needed by the trainees, each trainee did not receive an adequate amount of actual experience in performing janitorial work during the program to prepare him for the job market. Even if a number of the graduates did obtain custodial maintenance jobs, their job entry would have been more successful had they had more work experience.

The instructor felt his way along in the program (in the familiar Job Training Center style), keeping closely attuned to the needs of the trainees. Although he felt that "learning by doing" was the most effective way of teaching this group, his program did not include an adequate amount of this "doing." One of the employers who hired several graduates of this course stated that the trainees were familiar with the general routine, but they were not well prepared. He saw the need for more basic education and more skills training because, in many instances, janitorial workers are left more-or-less on their own once they are placed. They must be able to handle the full responsibilities of their job without close supervision.

It should be stressed that the first course started in March 1965, 10 months after the beginning of the program. This meant that many of the trainees enrolled in this course were those who needed the greatest amount of basic education and whose aptitudes were such that they were not qualified for the more skilled jobs such as clerk-typist or welder.

5. Welding.--This was a regular MDTA course taught at Lansing Community College. The project staff felt that the curriculum was perhaps too technical, especially in terms of mathematics. Within 2 weeks, 5 of the 7 trainees sent to attend the course were back at the Job Training Center for more basic education. The staff also felt that the Lansing Community College used the wrong techniques in dealing with the trainees. They treated them like regular college students, and made no effort to deal with the special problems of this group. It is worth noting that, of 25 regular MDTA trainees enrolled in this course, only 7 graduated, including the 2 trainees from the Job Training Center.

6. Nurses' aide.--This was also a regular MDTA course which is set up once a month by the Michigan State Department of Health. The Department agreed to let the Job Training Center have an entire class. It was a practical course which did not call for specific educational requirements. Its main drawback was that all hospitals in Lansing were conducting their own training for nurses' aides and did not give credit for training given elsewhere.

Evaluation of vocational training by the trainees.--One year after the completion of training, the trainees were asked to give their opinions about the appropriateness of the training occupations offered. Three of the questions asked were the following: (1) In the project area, is this kind of work usually steady, year-round work? (2) In the project area, is this kind of work usually well-paying work? (3) In the project area, would this be a job that white people usually do, or that colored people usually do, or that Spanish-speaking people usually do?

In answer to the first question, about 90 per cent of the trainees said "Yes" for at least 5 of the 7 occupations listed (nurses' aide, clerk-typist, welder, custodial maintenance, cashier, auto mechanic, seamstress).

For the second question, however, only 55 per cent gave a "Yes" answer for at least 5 of the occupations. Thus, the trainees felt that the jobs available in these occupations were usually steady and year-round, but they had reservations about the pay. Since many of these jobs paid the minimum wage on entry, the trainees were evidently knowledgeable about labor market conditions in Lansing, at least as far as these occupations were concerned.

In answer to the third question, 81 per cent of the respondents gave answers other than "white only" for all of the occupations listed. This shows that they perceived little discrimination in hiring practices because of race. A few respondents did mention racial discrimination, particularly with respect to clerk-typists and cashiers, which have been traditionally white jobs in the area.

The respondents were also asked the question "By the time you left training, did you learn to do enough of the important work skills a person has to know to do the kind of work you were trained for?" The following answers were given by respondents who were given work training:

	Per Cent
Yes	72.5
No, dropped out before training ended	8.2
No, length of training too short	11.0
No, instruction poor	3.7
No, physically or mentally not capable	4.6

When these same respondents were asked if "companies will hire a person without work experience but who has been taught the work skills at a training project," only 13 per cent answered "No." The following were the answers given:

	Per Cent
No, not further specified	10.5
No, training course inadequate	2.8
Yes, not further specified	45.8
Yes, training compensates for lack of experience	25.7
Yes, employer willing to give trainee a chance to show what he can do	13.3
Yes, inexperienced hired at lower wages	1.9

In general, the trainees were fairly satisfied with the choice of occupational courses and with their chances of employment after training. They were a little more critical about the quality of instruction given, as were the employers interviewed, and even the project staff, themselves.

C. On-the-Job Training

The original training plan was based on the assumption that the Lansing office of the Bureau of Apprenticeship and Training would cooperate with the on-the-job training phase of the project, and funds were released after a review team meeting in October 1964. But, after 17 weeks of negotiations, no steps had been taken by BAT. The project director then requested that OMAT amend the contract so that the Michigan Catholic Conference would have subcontract authority for on-the-job training. It was not until March 1965 that this arrangement was finalized. This delay necessitated adjustments in the plans for trainees and caused undue retention of trainees. Certainly, one of the weak points in the planning of the program was the failure to provide, from the start, on-the-job training opportunities for those trainees who were not particularly suited for or interested in the kinds of institutional training being offered.

Only 5 trainees were eventually given on-the-job training. The following paragraphs discuss these trainees.

Trainee number 1 (white male).--This trainee wanted to be a cook. He took training in basic education early in 1965, and then was sent to a restaurant in May 1965 for on-the-job training. He claimed that he never got any training as a cook; apparently all he did was help around the kitchen. After one and a half weeks he left. He worked more than 60 hours a week and his salary was $60.00 a week. The fact that this trainee was very obese evidently made it difficult for him to work the long hours required, and his not being trained as a cook made him decide to leave the job.

Trainee number 2 (Spanish-speaking male).--This trainee wanted to be placed in a course in electric appliance repair. Instead, he was sent in September 1964 to a locksmith as a repairer of locks. He claimed that he was working 12 to 15 hours a day at $65.00 a week for a 6-day week. When the project counselor went to the shop, after complaints by the trainee, the employer denied that he had required such long working hours. According to the respondent, the employer also disclaimed any connection between the Job Training Center and this job. Respondent left in April 1965 due to the flare-up of an old back injury.

Trainee number 3 (Negro female).--This trainee was sent to Lansing Business University for a course in typing from August 1965 to February 1966. She worked 40 hours a week for $48.00 a week. She dropped out due to illness.

Trainee number 4 (Negro female).--This female trainee was sent to the office of the Michigan Tuberculosis Association for on-the-job training in filing after 20 weeks of basic education. She dropped out after 10 weeks of on-the-job training due to a heart condition.

Trainee number 5 (white male).--This trainee was sent to a butcher shop in May 1965 for on-the-job training in meat cutting. He dropped out in November 1965 after he hurt his back lifting tubs.

The limited OJT program was therefore a failure, as the experiences of these 5 trainees indicate. This may be partly attributed to lack of planning and organization with respect to this phase of the program. However, it should be noted that all 5 trainees had some physical disability, which may be a significant factor in the failure of the OJT program.

D. Completion of Training

One of the most difficult problems facing those responsible for programs which train the hard core unemployed is that of dropouts. The average dropout rate for MDTA training programs is about 33 per cent and the Job Training Center did not differ from them in this respect. Of the 155 trainees interviewed 59 (38%) did not complete training.

It must be noted here that the length of the different courses given varied from 6 weeks (for cashiers who did not need basic education) to 62 weeks for some trainees in the custodial maintenance course (52 weeks in basic education and 10 weeks in vocational education). Furthermore, the length of stay required for those trainees who signed up for basic education only was anywhere from 10 to 52 weeks. Almost one half of those who did not complete training stayed with the Job Training Center as long as the trainees who completed training and, in some cases, longer.

Table 16 shows how trainees and dropouts were distributed by training occupation. Almost one third (32%) of all persons accepted in the program were signed up for basic education only. The reason for this is difficult to determine because there are no detailed reports of the interviews conducted during the screening and selecting process. The reports merely state that the counselors tried to slot trainees into courses which they felt best fitted their capabilities and aptitudes.

TABLE 16

COMPLETION OF TRAINING BY TRAINING COURSE

Training Course	Completed		Did Not Complete		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Basic education only	12	24.5	37	75.5	49	100.0
Clerk-typist	17	81.0	4	19.0	21	100.0
Nurses' aide	12	80.0	3	20.0	15	100.0
Auto mechanic	14	82.4	3	17.6	17	100.0
Custodian	27	84.4	5	15.6	32	100.0
Welder	2	100.0	-	-	2	100.0
Cashier	5	71.4	2	28.6	7	100.0
Seamstress	6	100.0	-	-	6	100.0
On-the-job training	1	16.7	5	83.3	6	100.0
Total	96	61.9	59	38.1	155	100.0

We are unable to infer from the personal characteristics of trainees (see Table 17) the reason for assigning close to one third of the trainees to basic education only. Contrary to what one might have assumed, the highest proportion of "basic education only" trainees was found in the small group of persons having 12 or more years of education. This seeming discrepancy may be explained by the relatively large number of Spanish-speaking trainees who were at the Job Training Center solely to learn the English language, and who had graduated from high school in the Latin American countries where they were born.

TABLE 17

TRAINING COURSE BY SELECTED CHARACTERISTICS

	Basic Education Only		Basic Education and Vocational Training		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Sex						
Both sexes	49	31.6	106	68.4	155	100.0
Male	33	35.1	61	64.9	94	100.0
Female	16	26.2	45	73.8	61	100.0
Ethnic group						
All groups	49	31.6	106	68.4	155	100.0
White	21	37.5	35	62.5	56	100.0
Negro	11	24.4	34	75.6	45	100.0
Spanish-speaking	17	31.5	37	68.5	54	100.0
Age						
All ages	49	31.6	106	68.4	155	100.0
Under 22	9	28.1	23	71.9	32	100.0
22-44	31	32.0	66	68.0	97	100.0
45 and over	8	30.8	18	69.2	26	100.0
Education						
All grades	49	31.8	105	68.2	154	100.0
8 or less	34	32.4	71	67.6	105	100.0
9-11	5	17.9	23	82.1	28	100.0
12	7	38.9	11	61.1	18	100.0
13 or more	3	100.0	-	-	3	100.0

There is some evidence that most of the disabled trainees were assigned either to basic education only or to the custodial maintenance course (see Table 18). Since the trainees enrolled in the custodial maintenance course stayed with basic education for about 10 months, one comes to the conclusion that the counselors assigned approximately three fifths of the trainees with disabilities to these 2 courses either because they were the ones most in need of basic education, or because they could not be trained in work skills.

TABLE 18

TRAINING COURSE BY TRAINEE DISABILITY

	Basic Education		Custodial Maintenance		Others		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
All trainees	49	31.6	32	20.6	74	47.8	155	100.0
Disabled	22	34.4	15	23.4	27	42.2	64	100.0
No disability	27	29.7	17	18.7	47	51.6	91	100.0

Some statistical tests of association (Phi test) were made between noncompletion and personal characteristics, as well as type of program taken. The data are given in Table 19. The coefficients of association computed show that, of the characteristics tested, only the type of program--basic education versus basic plus vocational education--correlates significantly with noncompletion.[7]

---

[7] The following are the results of the Phi test, with Type of Program having the only significant Phi coefficient (significant at the 1% level).

	Phi coefficient
Sex	.11
Race	.10
Age	.01
Education	.11
Type of Program	.69

TABLE 19

COMPLETION OF TRAINING BY SELECTED CHARACTERISTICS

	Completed		Did Not Complete		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Sex						
Both sexes	96	61.9	59	38.1	155	100.0
Male	55	58.5	39	41.5	94	100.0
Female	41	67.2	20	32.8	61	100.0
Ethnicity						
All ethnic groups	96	61.9	59	38.1	155	100.0
White	32	57.1	24	42.9	56	100.0
Negro	30	66.7	15	33.3	45	100.0
Spanish-speaking	34	63.0	20	37.0	54	100.0
Age						
All ages	94	61.4	59	38.6	153	100.0
Under 26	27	57.4	20	42.6	47	100.0
22-45	51	63.8	29	36.2	80	100.0
Over 45	16	61.5	10	38.5	26	100.0
Education						
All grades	95	61.7	59	38.3	154	100.0
8 or less	65	61.9	40	38.1	105	100.0
9-11	19	67.9	9	32.1	28	100.0
12	9	50.0	9	50.0	18	100.0
13 or more	2	66.7	1	33.3	3	100.0
Type of Program						
All trainees	96	61.9	59	38.1	155	100.0
Basic education only	12	24.5	37	75.5	49	100.0
Basic and vocational education	84	79.2	22	20.8	106	100.0

With respect to age, a perusal of the interview schedules showed that quite a few of the men in the older age groups dropped out due to illness or were otherwise physically disabled. This was not generally the case with the Spanish-speaking group. Many of the older men in this group left the project to take a job.

When we consider that the majority of dropouts were persons who had not received vocational training, it appears that the project actually did very well in terms of retention. Of the 106 persons who received vocational training, only 22 (21%) failed to complete the course. Further evidence of high project performance is shown in Table 20 which shows the reasons given by the 49 dropouts for not completing the training; the data are tabulated separately for the "basic education only" group.

TABLE 20

REASONS FOR DROPPING OUT

Reasons	Number of Trainees Taking: Basic Education Only		Basic and Vocation Education		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Financial[a]	17	45.9	4	18.2	21	100.0
Illness	5	13.5	9	40.9	14	100.0
Family problems	3	8.1	2	9.1	5	100.0
Lack of confidence in training or dissatisfaction with project	6	16.2	3	13.6	9	100.0
Others[b]	6	16.2	4	18.2	10	100.0
Total	37	100.0	22	100.0	49	100.0

[a] Includes leaving to take jobs, and insufficient allowances.

[b] Includes being asked to leave the project, (transfers, disciplinary action, etc.).

This table shows that a higher proportion of trainees in the basic education group dropped out for financial reasons than in the other group. The interview schedules of the dropouts were examined to determine if training allowances differed between the two groups. Ten of the dropouts taking basic education only (27%) were not eligible for training allowances; six of these 10 cited financial reasons for leaving. Four of the dropouts in the group taking basic plus vocational education were not eligible for training allowances; only 1 of these gave financial reasons for not completing training.

With such small numbers, conclusions, are at best, tentative. The data suggest, however, that more trainees in the basic education group dropped out because they saw fewer concrete opportunities to which the training would lead. The trainees in other group were being trained for specific occupations and thus could be expected to be more confident about their posttraining earning capacities. When the basic education trainees were able to find jobs, albeit unskilled and modest ones, they may not have had much motivation to forego this opportunity for further nonspecific training.

E. Counseling

The counseling activities of the Job Training Center may be described as both extensive and intensive; they started at the time the applicant was interviewed during the selection process, and lasted until 3 months after the termination of training (follow-up period), regardless of whether the trainee had been placed on a job or not. Counseling was most intensive during the basic education phase, however, with relatively little being available to those in vocational training. This, as previously noted, was considered a serious drawback by staff and trainees.

Counseling activities were directed not only to problems related to training per se, but also to those relating to the trainees' health, finances, housing, transportation, family, etc. Among the most common barriers preventing the trainees from adjusting to the program was what may be called their negative attitude toward solving life's problems. Fear, insecurity, suspicion, a lack of self-confidence, and proper motivation--all these prevented the trainee from being emotionally ready to enter the world of work even if the Job Training Center managed to make them "employable." The counselors' job, then,was to instill in the trainee a positive, realistic outlook, to convey to him that his opinions were important, that his dignity as a man really mattered, and that he had a place in the world.

The project discovered that the most effective way of accomplishing this result was group counseling. One of the staff members even went so far as to comment that this was the contribution of the project as an experimental venture. Group counseling had, in fact, been instituted as a practical solution to the heavy load carried by the counselors as both trainees and their problems increased. Group counseling was done with small groups who discussed their common problems. Efforts to overcome these problems helped to pull reticent trainees into the discussions; they would bring up subjects that they might not discuss in individual counseling sessions.

One trainee stated that many in the group had lost faith in the world and that through this program they were able to regain some faith in people and in themselves. Another trainee, however, said that only a few of the trainees in his course really tried to learn and that the others were there primarily for the money allowances. He echoed the frequent recommendation that the counselors should have worked with the trainees throughout the program; he felt that these trainees needed a combination of discipline and motivation.

One employer of a graduate from the program noted that it was very difficult for these people to overcome the fear of making mistakes and the fear of "trouble" while working. It took about 2 months for the trainee he had hired to lose his anxieties, after which time, he became a good employee.

Comments by the project staff and by employers suggest that quite a few of the trainees did respond well to the counseling and the training, but that success was far from universal. At the termination of the program, some of the trainees were still unruly, undisciplined, uninterested, and unprepared for the world of work.

Generally, the counseling program was good, but inadequate. It was good in that it provided many of the services needed by these people, and the kind of individual and group counseling which could assist them with many of their problems. It was inadequate in that the counselors did not have time to perform the total task which was their responsibility; their counseling program essentially ended when the trainee went into vocational training.

F. Auxiliary Services

One of the distinguishing features of the Michigan project was that it attempted to help the trainee with all his needs--all his social and personal problems. Thus, the project staff dealt with the trainees in the context of their home and family situation. They recognized at the outset that an individual's needs cannot be compartmentalized into economic, physical, social, and emotional sectors. Inability to cope effectively with nontraining related problems inhibits performance in any learning situation.

In their efforts to help the trainees, the project staff performed many auxiliary services. Among these were the "glasses program" in which about 50 trainees were supplied with eyeglasses for which they were charged less than cost and for which they were able to pay in weekly 1 dollar installments. This program was made possible through the cooperation of the Michigan Optometric Center.

The project also tried to help with the financial indebtedness of the trainees. The staff reported that more than half of the group were deeply in debt when they entered the program. The staff admitted, however, that they could not do too much to help in this area. All they could do was to make available a "revolving fund" from which the trainees could get emergency loans, and to offer counsel about being more prudent and efficient in the future.

The Volunteer Bureau of the Community Services Council in Lansing played a large part in providing auxiliary services for the trainees. Volunteer tutors were recruited to teach basic English and arithmetic to supplement the formal instruction given by the Job Training Center. In accordance with the project's objective of upgrading not only the trainee's situation in life, but also that of his family, a prekindergarten program for trainees' children was organized and staffed by volunteers.

Another volunteer project was the Trainees' Wives Program in which about 100 trainee families were represented. This group, initially a small one, met 1 night a week for instruction in homemaking and child care techniques. Soon the group sessions turned into discussions dealing with the lack of low income public housing. The wives invited the Director of Human Relations in Lansing to come and listen to their grievances and to advise them about what they might do to ameliorate their deplorable housing situation. He had been involved in some earlier, ineffective attempts to get public housing for the city and used this opportunity to organize a campaign for low income public housing. As a result, 2000 petitions were gathered by the women's group and presented to the City Council. The petitions were an effective device to call attention to the very inadequate housing conditions of low income persons. Subsequently, federal funds for 500 low income housing units were requested.

This is certainly a good example of effective action on the part of a minority group. It brought a pressing problem to public attention and pressured the government to do something about it. However, it should be noted here that this development was not intended by the Michigan Catholic Conference. As a matter of fact, the Job Training Center was careful to dissociate itself from the compaign, which was felt to have political overtones. The staff counseled moderation at all times, especially when the wives' group tended towards greater militancy.

G. Summary

The counseling and auxiliary services provided by the Job Training Center and its volunteers form the third side of a triangle whose other 2 sides are basic education and vocational training. These 3 components are essential for preparing members of the hard core unemployed for work and orienting them to the society from which they have so long been isolated by barriers of race, poverty, ignorance, and chronic unemployment.

It is really not possible to fully evaluate the success or failure of the Job Training Center in these 3 respects. Some parts of the program are easy enough to criticize, in particular the training component. Twenty weeks is not enough time to prepare a trainee for a competitive clerk-typist or auto mechanic position in the labor market. Basic education is harder to measure. The satisfactions gained by a trainee who learns how to read and write when he lacked these communications skills are no doubt enormous. So are the gains in self-respect experienced by once dependent relief recipients who have been helped toward self-support.

Thus, we can only speak in general terms. The training program was marred by lack of planning. Its curriculum was inadequate, and it lacked qualified instructors. Against this must be balanced flexibility in meeting individual needs, and the innovative, ingenious and personalized manner in which the project staff worked with the trainees. The trainees were not made to conform to the requirements of the training program; the program was adapted to the trainees. We feel that this approach of providing services to each trainee according to his unique needs, largely compensated for technical shortcomings.

VI. JOB DEVELOPMENT, PLACEMENT, AND FOLLOW-UP

Job development and the placement of trainees turned out to be one of the most successful phases of the project. Originally intended by the contract to be a joint effort of the Michigan Catholic Conference and the Michigan Employment Security Commission, this became more of a "do it yourself" project by the Job Training Center, as was the case with the recruitment and training phases of the program. According to the project staff, of about 140 trainee placements 3 months after the end of training, only 2 were due to the intervention of the Employment Security Commission.[8] About 2 dozen trainees were not placed in jobs due to severe physical disabilities, refusal to accept work, or attendance in other schools.

A. Methods and Techniques

A variety of job development techniques were tried by the Job Training Center, of which leg work and personal contacts were found to be most effective. The project staff first tried sending out brochures describing the training program and the trainees to prospective employers. Eight thousand brochures were sent out; 8 responses were received in return. In an interview conducted toward the end of the training program the project director concluded, in retrospect, that this failure was partly due to the fact that the brochures were sent out too early. When employers need people, they need them tomorrow or next week, not 2 months later. The project also tried advertising in newspapers and on television. This method also resulted in very few responses.

---

[8] The BSSR follow-up figures show a higher number of placements by the Employment Service (see page 79).

The staff member primarily responsible for job development and placement was an energetic and resourceful person, who realized from the beginning that her job could not be accomplished if she sat by the telephone waiting for job orders to come in. In view of the almost universal discrimination against the disadvantaged group as a whole, it was clear to her that the armchair technique of job development and placement would turn out to be unproductive. Instead, the job placement officer located potential employers from the Yellow Pages of the telephone directory, called either the personnel officer or the manager, and asked for an interview. During the interview, she would explain the aims of the project, describe the training program, and impress upon the employer the eagerness of the trainees to prove themselves in the world of work. As part of her "pitch" she would also explain how these vocational programs not only benefitted the trainees, but also the employers, since potential employees were being trained at no cost to the employer.

According to the placement officer, about 400 employers were contacted. For approximately one half of these contacts, the aim was to develop jobs for the project as a whole. The other half of the placement work involved calling on a potential employer with a specific trainee in mind. In this latter case the placement officer was very frank about the characteristics, race, previous criminal record, etc. of the trainee she was trying to place. Employers do not like surprises, and the success of future placements depended to a large extent on mutual honesty and understanding. In addition, the job development officer found it very helpful to convince the employer that she, personally, trusted the trainee she was trying to place and was confident of his sincerity and eagerness to do the job. The project staff tried to place first those trainees who were best qualified, as future placements depended upon the impressions the employer gained from the first trainee placed with him.

One of the lessons learned by the project staff with regard to job placement was to avoid high pressure salesmanship, the "hard sell." In one case where pressure was used, a graduate of the nurses' aide program was reluctantly accepted by one of the local hospitals. The moment she committed a very minor infraction of the hospital rules, she was fired.

The cashier training program offers a good example of the technique of job development used by the Job Training Center. When the training program was set up, the job development officer, who was also the course instructor, talked to prospective employers and asked them about their requirements for cashiers in terms of knowledge and skills. This made the employers more receptive when placement time came. The big chain stores were first contacted, since they would have the most job openings; however, as will be discussed later, an unfortunate misunderstanding with the unions prevented these chain stores from hiring the Job Training Center graduates. Some small, independent stores were then called, and this resulted in the placement of 6 cashier trainees (out of 8 who completed the course).

The job development officer did not confine her activities to finding jobs for the trainees. She was so successful in developing jobs for almost all of the trainees in the program that Employment Service counselors referred to her for placement many of their hard-to-place persons. Thus the project's placement activities included a number of people who came to them or who were referred to them, but who were not associated with the training program in any other way. This is one more example of the way in which the Job Training Center supplemented the function of other agencies in Lansing.

B. Requirements for Employment

The project staff encountered a number of problems in their efforts to place the trainees. They found that employers had a variety of requirements apart from job skills. These requirements related to education, race, age, union membership, physical disabilities, and certain other nonskill characteristics.

Education.--As mentioned in Chapter II, the biggest employers in Lansing were General Motors, the State Government, and the education institutions. General Motors required a high school diploma for all its employees and the State Government and the schools required that every applicant take a Civil Service examination. These were formidable barriers to entry into the labor market as far as the Job Training Center trainees were concerned.

With their wide acquaintance with employers in Lansing, and with the help of the Job Training Center's Citizens' Advisory Committee, whose membership included several of the large employers, the project staff tried to have these requirements waived in the case of the trainees. They were not very successful in accomplishing this; the Oldsmobile Division of General Motors did hire 2 of the trainees, but the project director considered this an act of charity. Thus, there were no far-reaching effects in pulling down institutional barriers to employment of the disadvantaged.

Faced with this inflexible attitude, the project staff tried other tactics. As mentioned above, they contacted the smaller employers who were not so rigid in their requirements. They also coached the trainees in filling out application forms, taking employment tests, and deportment during job interviews. The staff found this instruction in employment procedures very important, since the first thing a job applicant is usually asked to do is to fill out an application form; most of these forms are geared to persons with high school diplomas. Similarly, test procedures, particularly in the cashier and clerk-typist categories, proved difficult for many trainees. The job interview was another hurdle facing the trainee seeking work. He might have acquired some self confidence while in the Job Training Center, but to go out and handle himself confidently during a job interview was another matter. Rehearsals for handling all aspects of an interview were conducted with many of the trainees.

Thus, the Job Training Center was not able to change the traditional requirement of a high school education specified by most of the big employers in Lansing. However, they did upgrade the reading, writing, and arithmetic skills of the trainees to a level where many of them were able to get placed in jobs for which they would never have been considered before their Job Training Center experience.

Ethnicity--One of the policy decisions which has to be made in setting up manpower training programs is whether to train members of ethnic minorities for occupations in which there is racial discrimination in hiring and attempt to overcome this barrier, or to accommodate to traditional practices by training them only for those occupations in which minority members have been traditionally employed.

The Michigan Catholic Conference showed unusual courage in training Negroes and Spanish-speaking persons for occupations which were traditionally reserved for Caucasians--clerk typist and cashier. Among the trainees interviewed in the survey, only 2 out of 21 in the clerk-typist class, and only 2 out of 7 in the cashier class, were whites. With much persistence and effort, the job placement officer was able to place Negro trainees in cashier and clerk-typist positions. This was a drastic innovation for some of the white employees in the stores and offices where the trainees were placed; the manager of one of the stores decided to call a special meeting of his employees in order to prepare them for the introduction of Negro coworkers.

All but 1 of the cashier trainees who completed the course were placed. The job placement for the clerk-typists was not as successful: only 13 of the 21 trainees in the class were placed, not all of them as clerk-typists.[9] In this case, the difficulty was not primarily due to racial discrimination, but to the inadequate vocational training the trainees had received.

With respect to the other training occupations, race did not constitute a barrier. This may have been partly due to the booming economy in Lansing in 1964-1965. There was great demand for workers, and the nonwhite unemployed found it easier to enter the labor market under these circumstances.

Age.--Age was a barrier to entry in 2 occupations--welding and automechanics helper. Employers felt that welding was very demanding work physically and that older workers were more susceptible to back injuries. In the case of auto mechanic helpers, both older men and very young men (under 20 years) were at a disadvantage. The teenagers were considered to be unreliable and sometimes unruly. Thus, men in the prime working age groups were preferred. Except for the oldest age group, age did not prove to be a barrier to entry in the other occupations.

---

[9] Two were placed as clerks with the State Civil Service Commission as temporary employees after they had failed the employment test. Both were rated by their supervisor as very competent.

Union membership.--Disadvantaged unemployed workers often find it hard to get steady, full-time jobs because they are not members of a local union. An example of the difficulties encountered in this area was the cashier program. The job placement officer was informed by the manager of a big chain store that union rules required that part-time workers have first chance at any full-time vacancy. This meant that trainees could only be placed on a part-time basis--10 or 15 hours a week. For women, who were supporting themselves or their families, this was obviously insufficient. Consequently, the graduates of the cashier course were referred to the smaller retail stores, where the pay was lower.

Physical disabilities.--The project experienced the greatest placement difficulties with trainees who suffered from severe back injuries. At the time of the interview, these disabled trainees either had not been able to find work at all, or had been forced to leave their jobs after a few weeks or months due to the recurrence of their back trouble. Officials at the Workman's Compensation Bureau had also warned employers not to hire men with back injuries because of possible recurrences. One solution offered by employers was that these men pay their own insurance costs, but this they could not afford to do.

The project staff came to the reluctant conclusion that in their next project, physically disabled applicants would have to be screened out and referred to other agencies, such as the Vocational Rehabilitation Administration. However, this situation also represents an opportunity for instituting a federally-supported bonding program for high insurance risks.

Nonskill characteristics.--The job placement officer was very emphatic about the importance of certain nonskill characteristics like dependability, previous employment history, and work attitudes--what she termed "intangibles."

Employers were reluctant to hire a person with a previous record of changing jobs every 2 or 3 months. Unfortunately, this was the record of many of the trainees. The job placement officer often had a hard time trying to convince employers that, as a result of the training received at the Job Training Center, the trainees' attitudes and work habits had changed. The placement officer stressed that the trainees now wanted a chance to prove that they could be steady, dependable employees, and, in many instances, this approach was successful. The margin of difference between being hired or not was attributable to the personal, face-to-face contact with the prospective employer.

C. Follow-up

One reason for the success of the job development and placement efforts of the project was the project's commitment to back up its trainees. The placement officer explained to the employer that trainees would receive counseling for employment and personal problems for about 1 year after they had been hired. Consequently, employers were more willing to take a chance. As part of the follow-up program, the project staff contacted the employer if a trainee had been released from employment, to determine the cause of failure. This procedure was very helpful to the project as it provided the staff with much information about reasons for failure and helped them gain understanding of problems which the trainees encountered following placement. The availability of project staff for counsel and assistance following termination of training also gave trainees reassurance that they continued to have the support of someone who understood their problems and was willing to help.

Actually, the planned one-year follow-up program was not fully carried out. Although periodic follow-ups took place, lack of manpower prevented complete coverage. The placement officer left about 10 months after the end of training, and her job was left unfilled. This apparently had some effect on the employment rate of the trainees, 33 per cent of whom were not employed at the time of the one year follow-up interview. Since the project had reported a placement rate of about 85 per cent 3 months earlier, this meant that unemployment among the trainees had doubled in 3 months.

In a telephone interview the job placement officer said that she had left this position in March 1966. Upon examination of the interview schedules, it was found that 20 trainees had left their jobs after March 1966. Ten of them left because of illness, accidents, or previous physical disabilities. The remainder were young people under 22 years of age who apparently were not yet mature enough to live up to the responsibilities of a job. Some of the comments of the interviewers about these young people were: "stoic, indifferent, unconcerned"; "very lazy young man, just wants to lie around"; "just got laid off, no self-confidence." These comments illustrate the need for continuous follow-up of these persons if they are to be pointed in the "right" direction and kept there. Too much of this could, of course, be dangerous, resulting in the trainee becoming too dependent on the placement officer, or on his counselor. A delicate balance must be preserved here.

The experience of the Job Training Center seems to indicate that an aggressive, resourceful person, wise in the ways of the business world, is needed for successful job development and placement. The fact that many ex-trainees left their jobs when the placement officer left hers indicates further that long-term follow-up is essential.

D. Analysis of Placement Activity

During the interview, the trainees were asked what the project had done, apart from the training, to help them get jobs. One of the questions asked was: "Did the project give you names of employers for you to go talk to about a job?" The following were the answers given:

	Number	Per Cent of Total
No	71	45.8
Yes	75	48.4
NA	9	5.8
Total	155	100.0

Those who answered "Yes" were asked if they went to see these employers, if they got jobs as a result, and if these jobs were training-related or not. Only 2 of the 75 who were given names did not go; one became ill, and the other felt that he had very little chance of being hired. Table 21 shows the outcome for the 73 trainees who went to see the employers to whom they had been referred.

TABLE 21

RESULTS OF PROJECT REFERRAL TO EMPLOYERS

Results	Number		Per Cent of Total	
Did not get jobs	22		30.1	
Got jobs	51		69.9	
Training-related		34		46.6
Not training-related		9		12.3
Not given work training		7		9.6
Not ascertained		1		1.4

Of the 51 trainees who got jobs, 54 per cent got placed within a week after they left the Job Training Center, 32 per cent within 2 to 4 weeks, and 14 per cent had to wait more than 4 weeks before getting employment.

We notice from the answers given by the trainees that 71 out of 155 were not referred to employers by the project staff. Further investigation shows that 10 of these persons were sent to the Employment Service; of these, 6 went, and 2 were placed in jobs. Seventeen of these 71 respondents also reported that the project assisted them in other ways. They were helped to find temporary jobs, or given a card or certificate which they might show to employers. Thirty-three of these 71 trainees went out to search for jobs on their own; 27 of them were placed. It is interesting to note that of the 27 who found jobs on their own, 11 had taken the basic education course only, and had dropped out of the course to take jobs.

It should be mentioned that the various employment related activities were not mutually exclusive. One person could have been given the names of employers, been sent to the Employment Service, or searched on his own before finally landing a job. Many of the trainees for whom none of these services were performed already had jobs which they had obtained either before or during the training.

The trainees were also asked whether the project had told them to go to the Employment Service about getting a job, whether they had gone, and whether they had found a job. The answers to these questions are shown in Table 22. Of the 13 placements which resulted from this activity, 4 were training-related, 4 were not training-related, 3 involved graduates who had only taken the basic education course, and the type of job for the other 2 could not be ascertained.

TABLE 22

RESULTS OF PROJECT REFERRAL TO EMPLOYMENT SERVICE

	Project Activity						Total	
Trainee Activity	Not Told to Go		Told to Go		NA			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Did not go	95	80.5	11	39.3	-	-	106	68.4
Went, but did not get job	15	13.7	12	42.8	-	-	27	17.4
Went and got job	8	6.8	5	17.9	-	-	13	8.4
NA	-	-	-	-	9	100.0	-9	5.8
Total	118	100.0	28	100.0	9	100.0	155	100.0

These 13 placements do not quite agree with the report of the project staff that only 2 placements were due to the Employment Security Commission. This discrepancy could perhaps be explained by the fact that some of the interviews with the project staff were made some time before the trainees were interviewed. The trainees might also have obtained jobs through the Employment Service without the knowledge of the project staff.

A third type of job search activity was investigated by asking the questions "Did you go to see any employers on your own to look for a job when you left training? Did you get a job with one of these employers?" Of the 155 respondents, 78 said they did not go to see any employers on their own. Most of these persons gave as a reason either the fact that they already had jobs, or personal or family reasons. Of the 77 who initiated their own job search, 56 got jobs, as shown in Table 23.

TABLE 23

RESULTS OF TRAINEES' OWN JOB SEARCH

Results	Number	Per Cent of Total
Made own job search	77	100.0
Did not get job	21	27.3
Got job	56	72.7
Training-related	13	16.9
Not training-related	27	35.0
Not given work training	16	28.8

We note that less than one fourth of the jobs found as a result of the trainees' own efforts were training related. This is a much lower proportion than was the case when the job placements were due to the project's direct activity on behalf of the trainees, as shown in Table 24.

TABLE 24

JOB SEARCH ACTIVITY BY TRAINING RELATEDNESS OF JOBS ACQUIRED

Characteristics of Jobs Found	Job Search Activity						Total	
	Project		Employment Security		Own Search			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Training-related	34	66.7	4	30.8	13	23.2	51	42.5
Not training-related	9	17.6	4	30.8	27	48.2	40	33.3
Not given work training	7	13.7	3	23.1	16	28.6	26	21.7
NA	1	2.0	2	15.3	-	-	3	2.5
Total	51	100.0	13	100.0	56	100.0	120	100.0

Table 24 also shows that 120 out of 155 trainees (77%) had acquired jobs in 1 way or another as against an employment rate of 85 per cent reported by the project. This discrepancy can be explained by the omission from Table 24 of those persons who already had found jobs while in training, including a few nurses' aides who were considered as working while being trained in hospitals. The questions from which the data for Table 24 were taken asked for job search activity after the trainees had left the Job Training Center.

Summing up, we feel that the job development and placement activities of the project were very good. Two factors probably contributed to this success: a very effective job development and placement officer, and the high employment economy in Lansing during 1965.

VII. LONG RANGE OUTCOME OF TRAINING

Previous sections of this report have already given some indication of the early results obtained by the project in placing its trainees. In this section, outcomes are discussed in greater detail and over a longer time period. For example, we shall examine how personal characteristics affected the trainees' placement rate in the long run. Were the trainees satisfied with the work conditions in the jobs they obtained after training? To what extent should the employment outcomes be attributed to the impact of training?

Occupation before and after training.--One of the goals of the project was to upgrade the trainees' skill level. This was accomplished, as shown in Table 25. The upgrading in work skills is shown most clearly in the clerical and sales category. Twenty eight per cent of the 106 trainees were prepared for clerical jobs, whereas only 4 per cent were employed in such work prior to training. Sixteen per cent of the trainees were trained for skilled occupations as compared to 7 per cent who were in this occupational category before training. Very few of the trainees (about half a dozen) experienced downgrading of skills (being trained for service occupations whereas they held skilled or semiskilled occupations before training). These were mostly men who were disabled because of physical injuries incurred in their former jobs.

TABLE 25

PRIMARY PRETRAINING OCCUPATION, TRAINING OCCUPATION AND POSTTRAINING OCCUPATION
(by Occupational Categories)

Ethnicity and Occupational Category	Occupational Category[a]					
	Pretraining[b]		Trained for		Posttraining[c]	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
All ethnic groups	106	100.0	106	100.0	106	100.0
Professional and managerial	-	-	-	-	1	0.9
Clerical and sales	4	3.8	30	28.4	15	14.2
Skilled	7	6.6	17	16.0	8	7.5
Semiskilled	10	9.4	10	9.4	11	10.4
Service	37	34.9	49	46.2	42	39.6
Laborers, except farm	19	17.9	-	-	19	17.9
Farm workers	18	17.0	-	-	4	3.8
No previous experience	11	10.4	-	-	2	1.9
Unemployed	-	-	-	-	4	3.8
White	35	100.0	35	100.0	35	100.0
Professional and managerial	-	-	-	-	1	2.8
Clerical and sales	-	-	5	14.3	3	8.6
Skilled	2	5.7	6	17.1	3	8.6
Semiskilled	-	-	1	2.9	2	5.7
Service	14	40.0	23	65.7	16	45.7
Laborers, except farm	7	20.0	-	-	7	20.0
Farm workers	6	17.1	-	-	3	8.6
No previous experience	6	17.1	-	-	-	-
Negro	34	100.0	34	100.0	34	100.0
Professional and managerial	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clerical and sales	3	8.8	13	38.2	7	20.6
Skilled	3	8.8	2	5.9	2	5.9
Semiskilled	6	17.7	2	5.9	-	-
Service	15	44.1	17	50.0	19	55.9
Laborers, except farm	4	11.8	-	-	2	5.9
Farm workers	-	-	-	-	-	-
No previous experience	3	8.8	-	-	-	-
Unemployed	-	-	-	-	4	11.7
Spanish-speaking	37	100.0	37	100.0	37	100.0
Professional and managerial	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clerical and sales	1	2.7	12	32.5	5	13.5
Skilled	2	5.4	9	24.3	3	8.1
Semiskilled	4	10.8	7	18.9	9	24.3
Service	8	21.6	9	24.3	7	18.9
Laborers, except farm	8	21.6	-	-	10	27.0
Farm workers	12	32.5	-	-	1	2.7
No previous experience	2	5.4	-	-	2	5.4

[a] Only the work experiences of the 106 trainees who were given training in work skills are analyzed here.

[b] Pretraining occupation refers to the occupational category of the kind of job which the respondent had done more than any other kind before he applied for training.

[c] Posttraining occupation refers to the occupational category of respondents' current or last job at the time of interview.

The project trained 48 persons who were formerly unemployed or working as unskilled laborers. Fifty-four per cent of the whites, 21 per cent of the Negroes, and 60 per cent of the Spanish-speaking trainees were in this unskilled category.

The last column of Table 25 gives the respondent's occupation at the time of the posttraining interview (or his most recent posttraining occupation if he was unemployed at the time of the interview). It can be seen that only one half of the respondents who were trained for clerical or sales jobs had found employment in this occupation during the year following training. The same holds true for those trained in skilled occupations.

A comparison of the pretraining and posttraining periods shows that following training, more trainees found employment at some time in the 4 categories (clerical and sales, skilled, semiskilled and service occupations). The proportion of laborers remained the same, but the proportion who were unemployed or farm workers decreased rather sizably from about 29 per cent to 9 per cent. This decrease was most marked among the Spanish-speaking respondents, where the proportion in this category decreased from 38 per cent to 8 per cent. Of 12 migrant farm workers, only 1 trainee remained in this occupation; 4 had become industrial laborers and the rest were in occupations for which they had been trained.

Table 26 shows the posttraining employment status of all trainees (including those who received only basic education). Again, the decrease in the number of farm laborers and the increase in the clerical/sales category are prominent.

TABLE 26

POSTTRAINING OCCUPATION OF TRAINEES AND CHANGE FROM PRETRAINING OCCUPATION[a]

Posttraining Occupation	White		Negro		Spanish-Speaking		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
				Posttraining Occupation				
Professional and technical	2	3.6	-	-	-	-	2	1.3
Clerical and sales	4	7.1	8	17.8	6	11.1	18	11.6
Skilled	6	10.7	2	4.4	6	11.1	14	9.0
Semiskilled	7	12.5	2	4.4	10	18.5	19	12.3
Service	17	30.4	24	53.3	10	18.5	51	32.9
Laborers, except farm	13	23.2	3	6.7	11	20.4	27	17.4
Farm laborers	3	5.4	-	-	1	1.9	4	2.6
Never worked	-	-	-	-	6	11.1	6	3.9
Unemployed[b]	4	7.1	6	13.3	3	5.5	13	8.4
Other[c]	-	-	-	-	1	1.9	1	0.6
Total	56	100.0	45	100.0	54	100.0	155	100.0
				Change[d] from Pretraining Occupation				
Professional and technical	2	3.6	-	-	(3)	(5.5)	(1)	(0.6)
Clerical and sales	3	5.3	5	11.1	4	7.4	12	7.7
Skilled	1	1.8	(1)	(2.2)	1	1.9	1	0.6
Semiskilled	0	-	(4)	(8.9)	5	9.3	1	0.6
Service	1	1.8	2	4.4	(1)	(1.9)	2	1.3
Laborers except farm	1	1.8	(2)	(4.4)	2	3.7	1	0.6
Farm laborers	(6)	(10.7)	(1)	(2.2)	(11)	(20.4)	(18)	(11.6)
Never worked	(3)	(5.3)	(4)	(8.9)	(1)	1.9	(8)	(5.2)
Unemployed	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Others[c]	(3)	(5.3)	(1)	(2.2)	1	1.9	(3)	(1.9)

[a] Cf. Table 10, page 35.

[b] Persons who were unemployed during the 12-month period after training but who had primary pretraining occupations.

[c] Includes students and persons whose occupations could not be ascertained.

[d] Figures below in parentheses indicate decreases.

Comparing Tables 25 and 26, it can be seen that those who had training in work skills fared considerably better than the group as a whole.

As Table 26 shows, only 13 persons (8.4% of the total trainee group) had not been employed at all during the 1-year period following training. At any given point in time, the unemployment rate was, of course, much higher, since quite a few of the trainees changed jobs and experienced intermittent periods of unemployment.

Employment status at the time of application and on the date of interview.--In our follow-up interview, we asked the trainees about their employment status at the time they applied for training and at the time of the interview (approximately 1 year after the end of training). Table 27 shows the results. This table shows that 50 out of 155 trainees (32%) who were unemployed before training were employed 12 months later. On the other hand, 18 trainees (12%) who had been employed before training were unemployed 12 months later.

TABLE 27

EMPLOYMENT STATUS BEFORE AND AFTER TRAINING

Employed at Time of Application	Employed at Time of Interview						Total	
	No		Yes		NA			
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
No	32	20.6	50	32.3	-	-	82	52.9
Yes	18	11.6	53	34.2	-	-	71	45.8
NA	1	0.6	-	-	1	0.6	2	1.3
Total	51	32.9	103	66.5	1	0.6	155	100.0

There was a change for the better in the wages received by most of the 53 trainees who were employed both before and after training. Only 5 of these trainees were getting lower wages than before, as shown in Table 28.

TABLE 28

WAGES RECEIVED BEFORE AND AFTER TRAINING[a]

Before Training	After Training				Total
	Less than $1.25	$1.25-$2.24	$2.25-$3.24	$3.25 or Over	
Less than $1.25	1	15	5	1	22
$1.25-$2.24	2	13	7	4	26
$2.25-$3.24	-	2	-	-	2
$3.25 and over	-	-	1	-	1
Total	3	48	13	5	51[b]

[a] Includes only trainees employed prior to training and also 12 months after training.

[b] Wages of 2 trainees could not be ascertained.

With respect to the number of hours worked, 33 of the 53 trainees (62%) experienced an increase; this is shown in Table 29.

TABLE 29

HOURS PER WEEK WORKED BEFORE AND AFTER TRAINING

Before Training	After Training					Total
	Less than 24	24-39	40	41-48	Over 48	
Less than 24	2	3	-	1	1	7
24-39	1	1	4	-	1	7
40	1	-	6	4	1	12
41-48	1	-	4	1	4	10
Over 48	-	2	8	3	4	17
Total	5	6	22	9	11	53[a]

[a] Includes only trainees employed prior to training and also 12 months after training.

Thus, both in terms of wages received and hours worked, most of the trainees in this category seemed to have improved their situation.

Comparison of selected characteristics of employed and unemployed trainees.--Table 30 compares employed and unemployed trainees in terms of ethnicity, sex, age, completion of training, and training occupation.

TABLE 30

SELECTED CHARACTERISTICS OF EMPLOYED AND UNEMPLOYED TRAINEES
(At Time of 12-Month Follow-up Interviews)

	Employed		Not Employed		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Total	103	67	52	33	155	100.0
Ethnicity						
White	41	73	15	27	56	100.0
Negro	30	67	15	33	45	100.0
Spanish-speaking	32	60	22	40	54	100.0
Sex						
Male	70	75	23	25	93	100.0
Female	33	53	29	47	62	100.0
Age[a]						
Less than 22 years	32	68	15	32	47	100.0
22-45	52	65	28	35	80	100.0
Over 45	19	70	8	30	27	100.0
Completion of Training[a]						
Completed	70	72	25	28	95	100.0
Basic education only	(8)	(67)	(4)	(33)	(12)	(100.0)
Basic education and vocational training	(62)	(75)	(21)	(25)	(83)	(100.0)
Dropouts	33	56	26	44	59	100.0
Basic education only	(23)	(62)	(14)	(38)	(37)	(100.0)
Basic education and vocational training	(10)	(46)	(12)	(55)	(22)	(100.0)

[a] Not ascertained for one trainee.

A higher percentage of Spanish-speaking respondents were unemployed, perhaps because only in this group were there persons who had never worked at all. A higher proportion of men than women were employed at the time of interview, reflecting the propensity of women to move in and out of the labor force with marriage or when family problems arise. Age does not seem to have much influence on employment status as all 3 age groups have approximately equal ratios of employed to unemployed trainees. However, completion of training played a significant role. A higher proportion of those who completed training were employed at the time of interview. This was chiefly the result of vocational training--75 per cent of this group were employed at the time they were interviewed.

Length of unemployment.--The trainees were asked how much unemployment they had experienced during the 12-month period prior to application and the 6-month period before the interview. Table 31 shows the respective number of respondents who had been employed at all times during each of the 2 periods. There was an improvement among all 3 ethnic groups--a consistent result which we tend to attribute largely to the training received, rather than the prosperous conditions in Lansing, since during the 12-month period preceding training, prosperity was already well under way in Lansing.

TABLE 31

PER CENT OF RESPONDENTS WITH NO EXPERIENCE OF UNEMPLOYMENT

		Per Cent with No Unemployment During		Change
		12 Months Before Training	Six Months Before Interview	
All ethnic groups	(N=155)	29.7	52.9	23.2
Male	(N=93)	33.3	55.9	22.6
Female	(N=62)	24.2	48.4	24.2
White	(N=56)	26.8	50.0	23.2
Male	(N=48)	31.2	52.1	20.9
Female	(N=8)	0.0	37.5	37.5
Negro	(N=45)	35.6	55.6	20.0
Male	(N=16)	37.5	56.2	18.7
Female	(N=29)	34.5	55.2	20.7
Spanish-speaking	(N=54)	27.8	53.7	25.9
Male	(N=29)	34.5	62.1	34.3
Female	(N=25)	20.0	44.0	24.0

Trainees' reactions to work experience.-- Those trainees who had found jobs after training seemed well satisfied with their work. Ninety-one per cent reported they had steady jobs, and 69 per cent felt that these were well-paying jobs. Among trainees who were employed at the time of the interview, 58 per cent said they had good chances of being promoted as against 42 per cent who saw no chance of advancement. Table 32 shows the trainees' reactions to their work experience.

TABLE 32

REACTIONS TO WORK EXPERIENCE[a]

	Completed Training		Dropped Out of Training		Total	
	N	%	N	%	N	%
Total	85	100.0	42	100.0	127	100.0
Steady job						
No	7	8.2	5	11.9	12	9.4
Yes	78	91.8	37	88.1	115	90.6
Well-paying job						
No	23	27.1	16	38.1	39	30.7
Yes	62	72.9	26	61.9	88	69.3
Chance of promotion[b]						
No	28	42.4	14	42.4	42	42.4
Yes	38	57.6	19	57.6	57	57.6

[a] Only those trainees who began their last or current job after training are included in this tabulation.

[b] Excludes 28 trainees who were not employed at time of interview.

A comparison of those who completed training and those who dropped out shows that the latter were not as well satisfied with respect to steadiness of jobs and adequacy of pay as those who completed training. The perceptions of the 2 groups were identical with respect to chances for promotion.

To summarize, these are the principal training outcomes:

1. The project upgraded the work skills of the trainees. More men and women were trained for clerical and skilled occupations than had been in these occupations before training..

2. The project trained formerly unemployed and unskilled laborers for usable or higher work skills. This group comprised 45 per cent of the total before training.

3. There was a significant decrease in the proportion of persons unemployed or holding migrant farm labor jobs (27% to 9%) between the pretraining and posttraining periods.

4. Thirty-two per cent of the trainees who were unemployed when they applied to the training program had found employment at the time of interview; 12 per cent who were employed before training were unemployed after training; 34 per cent were employed before and after training and 21 per cent were unemployed during these two periods. Of all trainees, a total of 67 per cent were employed at the time of the 12-month follow-up interview. Eighty-seven per cent had been employed at some time during the 12-month period following training.

5. A higher percentage of unemployment occurred among the Spanish-speaking respondents than among the other 2 racial groups, among women as compared to men, and among dropouts as compared to those who completed training. The higher employment rate among those who completed training can be attributed to vocational training; in the "basic education only" group, the level of unemployment was higher in the group which completed training.

6. For all races and for both sexes, the proportion of those who had experienced no unemployment at all increased between the pre- and posttraining periods.

7. The trainees were generally satisfied with their work experiences after training. Most of them felt they had steady jobs and adequate wages, but they had reservations about their chances of advancement in these jobs.

VIII. CONCLUSION: FEATURES AND CAPABILITIES DEMONSTRATED BY THE MICHIGAN CATHOLIC CONFERENCE

Posttraining interviews with the trainees, the project staff, and various members of the Lansing community who were aware of the Job Training Center have clearly demonstrated that persons from low income families, who have language difficulties, who are educationally disadvantaged in the market place, and who have very little or no qualifying work experience, can be trained for gainful occupation through a comprehensive treatment approach which includes basic education, vocational training, cultural orientation, and intensive counseling. This was accomplished by the Michigan Catholic Conference and appears to have been accomplished well. Successful placement was, no doubt, greatly facilitated by favorable labor market conditions in Lansing. But, there is no question that this same disadvantaged group was unable to take advantage of equally favorable job opportunities prior to the training experience.

As was made clear throughout this report, the success of the project cannot be attributed to any single component of the program. However, a few techniques which seem to have contributed to the success of this program and which were stressed earlier, deserve special emphasis:

1. Written materials to attract recruits proved ineffective; therefore, informal recruitment channels were used. Thus, the party given by the Center's Negro secretary unlocked communications with the potential applicants in the Negro community; subsequent word-of-mouth recruiting--including a person-to-person recruitment drive by some trainees--brought in many recruits.

2. Volunteer services were used effectively in Lansing. Volunteers from Community Services Council provided valuable auxiliary services to the trainees and their families, such as tutoring, nursery school programs and cultural orientation.

3. The project was able to persuade the State welfare office to speed up the disbursement of food and other allowances to eligible trainees.

4. Group counseling was found to be the most valuable technique for instilling in the trainee a positive and realistic outlook and giving him the feeling of self-esteem which is indispensable for effective subsequent functioning in job situations.

5. Follow-up services after initial posttraining placement was one of the strongest features of the Lansing program, affecting job retention and performance. The Michigan experience proved that especially young workers without previous job experience and those with physical or emotional handicaps require a period of continuing support and counseling if they are to hold the jobs in which they were placed.

The Michigan project staff also developed other valuable insights concerning other aspects of the training situation which affect recruitment and training outcome. These have been summarized earlier (see pp. 20-22) and emphasize especially the need for well-timed recruitment and thorough and unambiguous explanations to potential recruits concerning such matters as training allowances, program content, and likelihood of obtaining training in the occupation of one's choice.

Looking at total project performance, some judgments can now be made concerning the suitability of the Michigan Catholic Conference as an agency for carrying out other experimental and demonstration objectives. Would it be a good candidate for a major role in manpower training and related occupational responsibilities?

Such judgments should be based on the agency's ability (1) to secure and initiate projects and obtain approval from state and federal agencies, (2) to recruit the target population, (3) to conduct various phases of the training program, (4) to accomplish placement, (5) to provide services supplementary to those provided by existing agencies, and (6) to involve other agencies in the community in the active solution of long-term problems of poverty and unemployment.

Ability to get the project started.--One of the most important conditions for getting any government training program off the ground is the ability on the part of program administrators to get approval for the project from the relevant government agencies. The preparation of appropriate proposals, documentation, etc., is the first essential step. The Michigan Catholic Conference has demonstrated this ability. It has negotiated a second contract with the Department of Labor to conduct 2 more training projects in Michigan; it has recently submitted a proposal to conduct a fourth training session for older unemployed workers in 1967. The 2 projects now in progress are:

1. The "Lansing Migrant Project" in Lansing, Michigan, for 300 migrants and other individuals in that area; and

2. The "Chippewa Indian Reservation Project" in Mt. Pleasant, Michigan, for 250 disadvantaged American Indians and others from the Mt. Pleasant area.

At the time of contract negotiations an experimental and demonstration project has to be approved by a federal review team composed of representatives from the Department of Health, Education and Welfare, and the Department of Labor. The experience of the Michigan Catholic Conference with this review team has served both parties well. Since this project was the first multi-occupational training programs in Michigan, the review team worked very closely with the administrative staff of the project, both in shaping the proposal and in guiding it through various bureaucratic channels. The Job Training Center may have helped shape the procedures of the federal review team.

Further, as previously discussed, the Michigan Catholic Conference had to be certified as a training agency by the State Department of Public Instruction before it could conduct any training at all. Relations with this department were initially not too favorable, mainly because its Division of Vocational Education felt that it should have been consulted in the early planning stages. However, workable relations have since been established; the second OMAT contract was granted with only slight resistance from the Department of Public Instruction, and without the Michigan Catholic Conference having to use any political pressure.

Ability to recruit the target population.--The Michigan Catholic Conference has amply demonstrated its ability to recruit the target population. Its failure to adhere to contract specifications with respect to ethnic origins was an artifact of the timing of the contract. The groups which were substituted for the original target population were at least equally disadvantaged. In fact, given the high incidence of persons with physical disabilities, it was probably an even more difficult group. Almost every trainee was a bona fide member of the hard core unemployed population--older workers, persons with very inadequate schooling from low income families, the long-term unemployed, and handicapped workers with emotional or physical disabilities.

Ability to conduct the various phases of the program.--Though plagued by lack of adequate planning and staffing due to a tight time schedule and unforeseen changes in the program design, the project staff showed its resourcefulness and ingenuity by providing adequate basic education and vocational training, and excellent counseling and other auxiliary services. A highly personalized approach served in large measure to mitigate whatever initial disadvantages were due to lack of planning. The ability to tailor programs to the specific and varied needs of various subgroups of disadvantaged persons deserves special notice. This is, however, one area where improvements are needed in future programs.

Ability to accomplish placement.--This was one of the most successful segments of the program. A placement rate of better than 85 per cent was achieved about 3 months after training. Although this had dropped to 67 per cent at the time of the 12-month follow-up interview, the results are still highly satisfactory. Those who remained employed reported that they were satisfied with their work experiences. Furthermore, those who were employed before and after training experienced improvements both in wages received and number of hours worked per week.

Unconventional but appropriate and persistent techniques used by the job development and placement officer were the principal reason for the success of this part of the program. Members of the formerly hard core unemployed have been integrated into the world of work with unquestionable benefits both to the individual and to society.

Ability to provide services supplementary to those provided by existing agencies.--It seems clear at this point that the Michigan Catholic Conference was forced by circumstances to perform functions not originally intended for it by its contract with OMAT and, thus, to supplement the services provided by other agencies in Lansing, such as the Employment Security Commission, the Vocational Rehabilitation Administration, the Bureau of Apprenticeship Training, and the Department of Social Welfare.

1. Michigan Employment Security Commission.--As discussed earlier, this agency was expected to work very closely with the Michigan Catholic Conference by assisting in recruitment, final selection, counseling, job development and placement. Actual participation was limited. The agency provided 2 counselors (both of them excellent), and placed a few trainees. The role of the Commission may be described as passive--they placed no roadblocks in the project's path but, on the other hand, they took no active part in its activities. They made their application files available to the project staff and did not insist that selection should be based on test scores. On the other hand, they made no effort to recruit actively; their job development and placement activities on behalf of the trainees were no different from what they ordinarily did for other clients, mainly telephone calls to employers.

However, the director of the Employment Security Commission was one of the originators of the project and took a personal if unofficial interest in the project. The 2 Employment Security counselors became imbued with the enthusiasm of the other members of the project staff and one of them later became the administrative assistant to the project director.

2. Vocational Rehabilitation Administration.--In Chapter IV, the large proportion of trainees with physical or psychological disabilities was noted. In training these persons, the Michigan Catholic Conference supplemented the training provided by the Vocational Rehabilitation Administration and, in doing so, discovered that their training and servicing facilities were not adequate for the very severely handicapped.

3. Bureau of Apprenticeship Training.--As mentioned in Chapter V, the Bureau of Apprenticeship Training was far from helpful in providing on-the-job training services for the trainees. The project, therefore, had to do its own job development for on-the-job training spots with local employers, a supplementary function which they did not accomplish too well since this was started very late in the program.

4. Department of Social Welfare.--This agency was quite cooperative and helpful to the project. They provided names of potential trainees to the Job Training Center, thereby going counter to state regulations. They stretched a few rules in order to accommodate trainees who were also welfare recipients. Emergency food orders were provided where necessary; whenever circumstances made it desirable, families continued to receive some welfare help even if they were receiving training allowances. Perhaps most important was the Department's agreement to the interpretation that a person in training was, in fact, seeking work (one of the requirements for receiving welfare allowances was that the recipient be unemployed and seeking work).

In spite of the sympathetic and helpful attitude of the social workers, it must be noted that the Department of Social Welfare never thought of itself as being responsible for rehabilitating the hard core unemployed. Some lip service was given to this idea in a report by the Board of Social Welfare, which stated that one of the impacts of the Job Training Center was the removal from public assistance rolls of some long-standing cases that appeared to be hopeless.[8] But, basically, the Department saw itself as an agency charged with the responsibility of sustenance and stuck to that role. Moreover, the concessions they made on behalf of the trainees were not extended to other welfare recipients. Such differential treatment of trainees and others does not bode well for the large scale adoption of demonstration tactics in the community.

---

[8] Cf. Report of the Michigan Catholic Conference to OMAT, February 1, 1965, page 7a.

Ability to involve other agencies and to handle problems of interagency cooperation.--It seems clear from the results observed that the Job Training Center succeeded in providing a viable model for organizations whose function is that of serving the hard core unemployed population. However, this achievement is a limited one unless the beneficial effects can be extended beyond the project's immediate clientele. The 150 trainees who passed through the Center represent only a small fraction of the disadvantaged population who might benefit from this type of training. Towards the end of the program 200 more "eligible" applicants were on the waiting list for the second project.

Unless there is a "spillover effect," unless the Job Training Center succeeds in demonstrating the efficacy of its approach in dealing with the hard core unemployed to the servicing or employing institutions in the community, the insights gained from the Center's experience will not benefit the total target population. From this point of view, the success of the project has not been impressive to date. But, this failure should be evaluated in the light of the national experience with widespread adoption of recent innovations for training the hard core poor and unemployed.

In the first place, much of the legislation on the books prohibits or makes difficult the adoption of new techniques. Given the predisposition of various institutions in Lansing--as elsewhere--to interpret their functions within the confines of the strict letter of the law, there seems to be little hope that the new techniques developed and demonstrated by the Job Training Center would be adopted in the near future by public agencies who serve the disadvantaged. What actually happened is that the various agencies in Lansing seemed only too glad to have something like the Job Training Center carry the burden of dealing with this most difficult segment of the unemployed labor force. One of the members of the BSSR Study Team concluded: "The likelihood that the partisanship of the Training Center on behalf of the poor will be institutionalized in the Lansing community is remote. When one seeks welfare institutions which will commit themselves to continuing the work of the Job Training Center, one finds a lack of such commitment. The Community Services Council, for example, sees no role for itself after the Job Training Center pulls out. The Employment Service sees the creation of new centers under the auspices of the Office of Economic Opportunity as a source of service for the very poor. It does not see itself in this role. The Department of Welfare is unable to visualize operating in the comprehensive model of the Job Training Center. It rather believes that it will continue to provide income maintenance pretty much as it has always done. It is almost as if the Job Training Center provided a social instrument to assuage the guilt of the existing social welfare community for its neglect of the poor people! These agencies were then able to resist pressure for structural change which would precondition them to serve rather than to exclude the poor, on the grounds that the poor were receiving service elsewhere. Thus, the Employment Service continues to require a high level of competence as reflected in the GATB, and Oldsmobile and Fisher Body continue to require high school diplomas from potential employees. The hope that neighborhood centers under OEO might continue where the Job Training Center left off was voiced by the director of the local office of the Employment Security Commission, one of the framers of the project. Even for him, the project demonstrated that another new agency needs to be created to train people up to the point where they will be ready to participate in regular MDTA programs coming out of his own office."

Perhaps it is not too farfetched to speculate that some spillover effect will ultimately occur, albeit in a different fashion. This can be described as a process of "influence by infiltration." While the direct impact of the Job Training Center on the existing agencies is probably minimal,[9] the Center may be affecting indirectly the supply and quality of manpower development services to the hard core unemployed. As new, more specialized manpower agencies are developing, the Center has supplied them with experienced administration. The directors of the Michigan Office of Economic Opportunity, the Michigan Migrant Opportunity, Inc., and the local Community Action Program are prominent examples. All are directed by former Job Training Center administrators. Furthermore, other administrators and instructors from the Center are now employed by some of the established educational agencies. The first director functions as superintendent of the Catholic schools in the State. The director of the Chippewa Indian Project is now with the Vocational Education Division of the State Department of Public Instruction, and another staff member is a city superintendent of public schools.

Slowly and indirectly, but persistently, the Michigan Catholic Conference seems to be recruiting professionals from existing agencies to its own demonstration programs, imbuing them with its philosophy and style of operation, and subsequently facilitating their move into sensitive positions in organizations which control the supply and quality of services available. This conclusion seems to be warranted by the observation that

---

[9] At least one agency, the State Department of Mental Health, now gives the poor priority in getting service. This change apparently resulted from a new director. The MCC had no influence, but does approve of it.

none of the administrators have stayed with the Michigan Catholic Conference for more than the duration of one project. The experience of the top staff at the Job Training Center has been broad, with opportunity to learn from direct participation in the training of many segments of the disadvantaged poor--migrants from the South, Chippewa Indians, and older unemployed workers. These demonstration projects are admittedly small scale and short term in nature. But the lessons learned in accomplishing the immediate goals of serving a limited number of trainees have general applicability.

Whether the intention was deliberate or not, some infiltration of the power structure has been made. The men from the project who have moved on to other servicing agencies in the Lansing area have some sophisticated knowledge of the internal organization of these agencies. There is hope, that, with their fresh outlook and the experience gained in the Job Training Center, they may be able to shake up the status quo and influence the servicing institutions in the right direction.